

HEBREW UNION COLLEGE - JEWISH INSTITUTE OF RELIGION
NEW YORK SCHOOL

INSTRUCTIONS FROM AUTHOR TO LIBRARY FOR THESIS

AUTHOR: Julie Berlin

TITLE: Role of Cantor/Educator in Synagogue

TYPE OF THESIS:

RABBINIC ()

SSM ()

D.H.L. ()

D.MIN. ()

M.A.R.E. ☒

M.A.J.S. ()

1. ☒ May be used without my written permission.
2. () My written permission is required for use during the next ____ years.

Note: The Library shall respect restrictions placed on theses for a period of no more than ten years.

I understand that the Library may make a photocopy of my thesis for security purposes.

3. The Library may sell photocopies of my thesis.

☒ yes ☐ no

THE KLAU LIBRARY
HEBREW UNION COLLEGE-
JEWISH INSTITUTE OF RELIGION
BROOKDALE CENTER
1 WEST 4TH STREET
NEW YORK, NY 10012

5/1/97
Date

Julie Beth Berlin
Signature of Author

LIBRARY RECORD

Microfilmed: _____

Date _____

Signature of Library Staff Member

THE ROLE OF THE CANTOR/EDUCATOR IN THE SYNAGOGUE

JULIE BETH BERLIN

Thesis Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of
Requirements for Master of Arts in Religious Education Degree

Hebrew Union College-Jewish Institute of Religion
School of Education
New York, New York

May 1997:

Advisor: Dr. Sherry Blumberg

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis could not have been completed without the help and guidance of several people.

First and foremost I would like to thank Dr. Sherry Blumberg for her continued support throughout this project. Her guidance, patience, and understanding were greatly appreciated during this time. Dr. Blumberg's creativity and knowledge are truly inspiring and exciting.

Cantors Mark Elson, Wendy Autenrieth, Scott Colbert, Miranda Beckenstein, and Sam Berman offered their time, information and suggestions in the personal interviews I conducted as part of my research.

My husband, Alan Berlin is always emotionally supportive, especially throughout this project. He assisted with much of the preliminary editing as well as taking care of our new son, Daniel, while I worked. I am grateful for Alan's continued love and support.

Foreword

It has become increasingly common to combine the roles of cantor and educator in synagogues throughout North America. Virtually no research has been done on this dual role. There has been considerable exploration into the individual roles, but this research on the combination of responsibilities of a cantor and educator is new territory. In order to research this duality of roles, I conducted personal interviews with cantor/educators currently serving Reform congregations and trained at Hebrew Union College-Jewish Institute of Religion.

My interest in this topic stems from being an invested cantor and studying for a masters degree in Religious Education. Upon completion of my studies I might possibly accept a cantor/educator position. This research will provide me with a clearer understanding of the advantages and disadvantages of performing both roles in a congregation.

Union of American Hebrew Congregations, and The American Conference of Cantors, Guidelines for Cantorial-Congregational Relationships (New York: UAHC Board of Trustees and the ACC, 1989), 4.

Chapter One

Definitions

The roles of cantor and educator have gradually been combined into one position in recent years in many synagogues throughout North America. The roles are often combined because of a synagogue's financial need, practicality, or efficiency. While some cantors have received formal education in preparation for the role of educator, many have no such training. Before defining what a cantor/educator is, it is important to first define the individual roles.

"Guidelines for Cantorial-Congregational Relationships," published jointly by the American Conference of Cantors (ACC) and the Union of American Hebrew Congregations (UAHC), defines a cantor as the following:

The Cantor as a *Shaliach Tsibur*, is a leader of the congregational worship experience. Cantors also participate in the celebration of Birth, in the education of the *B'nai Mitzvah*, in the ceremonies of Confirmation and marriage, in the funerals of their Congregants and often in counseling. Reform Cantors, in the tradition of the Cantorate, enjoy freedom in the practice of their calling, and with unique expertise in the music of our people, transmit Jewish values and identity to congregants of all ages.¹

¹Union of American Hebrew Congregations and The American Conference of Cantors, Guidelines for Cantorial-Congregational Relationships (New York: UAHC Board of Trustees and the ACC, 1989), 4.

In the same document, the roles of the cantor are defined in more detail. These roles include responsibilities such as service leader, teacher, being an expert of Jewish culture, participating in life cycle events, counseling, and leading in the community.

Dr. Larry Hoffman, a renowned liturgical scholar and previous Director of the School of Sacred Music at Hebrew Union College-Jewish Institute of Religion (HUC-JIR) in New York, offers a definition of a cantor in the ACC newsletter: The ideal cantor which HUC strives to graduate is one who "sings well, knows *nusah*, commands the fullness of our musical heritage and is overall a musical expert of the highest caliber."¹ Hoffman continues, "tomorrow's synagogues require absolutely and without doubt that cantors be socialized into the history and vision of Judaism; and that Reform cantors develop that vision with a full appreciation of the ways that Reform theology, history and values now are shaping it."²

Cantors were traditionally trained through apprenticeships with other cantors. A student would live with a cantor for a certain amount of time in order to learn the music and liturgy of the synagogue. After such an apprenticeship, with the approval of his mentor the student would then call himself a cantor. At that time, being a cantor was not a career. Since training institutions have been established, the cantor has come to be seen more as a Jewish professional than as a person who leads worship services as an

¹Walter Ackerman, "The Status of the Professional Jewish Educator: A Look at the Field," *To Build a Profession: Careers in Jewish*

¹Lawrence A. Hoffman, "Cantors and Soloists," *Koleinu*, May 1996, 1.

²*Ibid.*, 27-28.

aside to his/her full time career. Walter Ackerman has created a definition to distinguish a profession from the "run of occupations."¹

A profession is a form of human endeavor which:

1. provides a unique, definite and essential social service;
2. emphasizes intellectual techniques in the performance of services, such as: defining problems, searching for relevant data, and formulating possible solutions;
3. requires a long period of specialized training;
4. permits a broad range of autonomy for both the individual practitioner and the occupational group as a whole;
5. demands an acceptance by the practitioner of broad personal responsibility for judgments made and acts performed within the scope of professional autonomy;
6. places an emphasis upon the service to be rendered, rather than upon the economic gain to the practitioner, as the basis for the organization and performance of the social service delegated to the occupational group;
7. develops a comprehensive self-governing organization of practitioners which sets standards of entry and performance and contributes to raising the economic and social status of the group; and

¹Walter Ackerman, "The Status of the Professional Jewish Educator: A Look at the Record," To Build a Profession: Careers in Jewish Education, ed. Joseph Reimer, (Massachussets: Brandeis University, 1987), 27-28.

8. establishes a code of ethics which has been clarified and interpreted at ambiguous and doubtful points by reference to concrete cases.¹

Professional training for the Reform cantorate at HUC consists of courses in traditional as well as reform music and liturgy, Yiddish and Ladino music, Jewish history, Jewish music history, Jewish philosophy, education and, individual vocal training in the nuances of singing Jewish music. Also, several professional development courses are offered such as conducting and programming. Originally, it was a five year bachelor's program and it is only in the last 15 years that it was developed into a four year master's program. With the establishment of the master's program, cantorial students are required to spend their first year in Jerusalem along with rabbinic students. Students of the Masters of Sacred Music are required to write a thesis on some aspect of Jewish music that interests them and to present a recital based on their thesis. HUC-JIR in New York is the sole training school for Reform cantors.

Expectations for a congregational education director or principal have changed tremendously since the establishment of National Association of Temple Educators (NATE) in 1954. In the early years, the educator functioned as a principal whose role was mostly that of administrator overseeing the operation of the religious school. The principal's primary responsibilities included the selection and distribution of textbooks for the school's curriculum, making class assignments, hiring teachers and

¹Ibid.

maintaining discipline. "The administrative orientation of these positions is apparent in the fact that many congregational educators of this genre, including several NATE officers, became congregational administrators."¹

Today, many congregational education directors function completely as educators and are expected to perform a wide range of roles not previously considered part of the principal's job. These educators are responsible for adult education, family education, holiday programming, retreats, holiday and Shabbat services programming, *B'nai Mitzvah* training, as well as running the religious school.

"Even with regard to the school, the education directors' roles and responsibilities have evolved and increased. Education directors are supposed to be experts in Judaica and Hebrew, curriculum development, programming, teacher supervision and training, administration, child psychology, and working with parents, synagogue boards, and committees."²

In an article in Reform Judaism magazine, Dr. Michael Zeldin, professor of Jewish Education at HUC-JIR in Los Angeles, describes the role of an educator:

The challenge to the Jewish community is to nurture Jewish lives and souls, so that people can teach each other. This responsibility falls mainly on educational leaders (directors of education, rabbis, cantors, etc.), who must encourage teachers to realize their human potential, and to guide them as they

¹Roberta Louis Goodman, "The Changing Role of the Jewish Educator: Where We Came From and Where We Are Going," *Compass*, Fall 1994, 15.

²Ibid.

share themselves with others. Their primary responsibility is more interpersonal than administrative. As mentors to their staff, they must be given the organizational and material support necessary to nurture those who have direct contact with students. They must provide teachers with a vision of what is possible when Jews engage each other in learning and growing as Jews. Investing in the "human capital" of the congregation - its teachers - will go a long way in fostering commitment to a vibrant Jewish future.¹

In an article in Reform Judaism magazine, Barry Holtz, director of the Best Practices Project of the Council for Initiatives in Jewish Education (CIJE), defines effective educational directors as individuals who "among other tasks, provide continuity, build morale, and work with rabbis and lay leadership on issues of status and vision. Their primary role is educational, not administrative or organizational."²

The professional training for a Reform Jewish educator includes course work in both Judaic content and educational methodology. It is only in the last twenty years that there has been the emergence of master's programs for Jewish educational leaders. HUC-JIR trains Reform Jewish educators at its Los Angeles and New York campuses. In addition, several independent Jewish institutions of higher education, mainly those based in larger Jewish communities, offer master's degrees in Jewish education. These include the Spertus College of Judaica in Chicago, Baltimore Hebrew University, the Cleveland College of Jewish Studies, University of

¹Michael Zeldin, "Rethinking Jewish Education," Reform Judaism, Spring 1995, 51.

²Barry W. Holtz, "Schools That Succeed," Reform Judaism, Spring 1995, 56.

Judaism in Los Angeles, Boston Hebrew College, and Gratz College in Philadelphia. A small number of private universities, including Brandeis and Emory, offer a master's degree in Jewish education.

A cantor/educator, by definition, would be expected to perform all of the duties of both a cantor and an educator. However, in large synagogues and some smaller ones, this is not always possible without some adaptation to either the cantor's or the educator's list of responsibilities. In many large synagogues, for example, it is impossible for one person to perform all of the responsibilities of both roles, so additional staff is necessary for the benefit of both the congregation and the cantor/educator. In most cases, the cantor/educator either receives help with the *b'nai mitzvah* training or has no part in it at all. In other cases, an administrative assistant is hired for the religious school to perform some of the administrative duties that the cantor/educator may not have time to do in a large congregation.

Today the professional training of cantor/educators consists of the coursework of the cantorial program in addition to the coursework of the education program. No courses may be applied to both degrees, except those specific courses required for both. In addition to the cantorial courses, it is necessary to take additional educational methodology courses and Judaic courses such as bible, midrash and history. A master's thesis and fieldwork is also required to attain the Master of Religious Education. It is possible to work towards both degrees concurrently by taking extra classes during the academic year and the summer. Cantor/educators face

great challenges, but with the proper support and training they can be a great asset to congregations.



1. The interviewers must ensure the stimulus and confidential relationships of the interview in order to provide persons and confidential information when they would not ordinarily place on paper.

Chapter Two

Interview Process

In choosing my mode of research I did not have many options. This topic is relatively new and there has not been much research done in the area. My main sources are personal interviews with cantor/educators in the field. I developed an interview questionnaire with questions pertaining to the combined roles of cantor and educator and how they complement each other and detract from each other. I chose cantors in the field that currently perform both roles, including men and women in both large and small congregations. I chose cantors who were trained as educators, and cantors who took on the educational role either out of financial need or personal interest. The cantor/educators interviewed are scattered throughout the United States, thus all interviews were conducted by telephone.

As mentioned before, one of the main reasons for choosing to do personal interviews was a lack of previous research in the area. However, the use of the interview can be very valuable and practical. Some unique advantages of using the interview technique over a questionnaire include:

1. The interviewees may require the stimulus and confidential relationships of the interview in order to provide personal and confidential information which they would not ordinarily place on paper.

2. The interviewer may follow up leads and clues in a manner that is not possible by means of an instrument prepared in advance.
3. The interviewer may form some impression of the interviewee, in relation to the truth of the answers and the things that may have been left unsaid.
4. The interviewer may give information and develop attitudes on the part of the respondent, especially in a therapeutic relationship, sometimes encouraging exchange of ideas and information.
5. Since it is always possible for the respondent to read through the entire questionnaire first, or to edit earlier answers in the light of later questions, the advantages of saliency questions become dubious, and it is difficult to control the contextual effects of other questions upon a given answer. In the interview, later questions can be hidden from the knowledge of the respondent and, therefore, can have no effect of the results of an earlier question.
6. A resourceful interviewer with insight may produce certain favorable results not possible in the self-administering situation of the questionnaire, where the mistakes of the respondent have a quality of finality. For example, the interviewer may make ratings of given characteristics of the respondent, explain or amplify a given question, probe for clarification of an ambiguous answer or elaboration of a

cryptic report, or even persuade the respondent to answer a question that he would otherwise skip.¹

Of the many types of interviews I chose to conduct a structured and focused interview. A structured interview is used when the same information will be gathered from each interviewee. Since the answers of all of the respondents must be alike, the questions must be carefully phrased to impart the same meaning to all respondents. A focused interview is used when the primary emphasis is on the interviewee's interpretation of a specific situation and response to it. A set of prepared questions is used as a guideline for conversation, but may vary based on the direction of the discussion.

I conducted interviews over the phone using a set of prepared questions as a guide. In two cases, the respondents requested a copy of the questions beforehand so they might have a chance to think about their answers. In all other interviews the interviewees did not have prior access to the questions. The interview was more or less a discussion of both the role of the cantorial job and the role of the education job and how they interact with each other. The respondent was allowed to speak freely about the questions asked, and often there was some overlap of questions and answers. As interviewees responded to questions I recorded their answers on the

¹Carter V. Good, Essentials of Educational Research: Methodology and Design (New York: Appleton-Century Crofts, 1972), 239-240.

questionnaire. At the end of all of the interviews, I processed and analyzed the information.

Although the interview technique has many advantages, there are also some potential problems in its use. The reliability of the information is affected by such factors as the following:

1. The desire of many interviewees to make a good impression, particularly in answering questions relating to generally accepted standards of behavior.
2. The reluctance of many subjects to reveal highly personal information that might appear damaging to the interviewee.
3. An attitude of confidence in and respect for the interviewer, on the part of the interviewee.¹

Some other sources of error or bias in addition to basic psychological factors affecting the interaction between the interviewer and respondent include the following:

1. Content and form of questions
2. Procedures established for the interview
3. Physical setting
4. Mode of recording
5. Accidental distractions
6. Temporary state of the parties involved
7. Firmly fixed attitudes
8. Personality characteristics
9. Motives

¹Ibid. 249

10. Related factors of race, age, sex, religion, income, and education¹

Although these social and psychological qualities may create bias, it is only through behavior that bias can become influencing.

"This behavior on the part of the interviewer, includes asking questions, probing for additional information, recording responses, and motivating the respondent to communicate."²

In order to use the interview technique effectively and without bias, there are several steps the interviewer may take:

1. Develop techniques for formulating questions
2. Develop techniques for motivating the respondent
3. Develop techniques for focusing communication on the content objectives of the interview
4. Gain understanding of the "dynamics of interaction and of the psychological forces that affect the processes of the interview."³

While the potential pitfalls of the interview technique were certainly present, in the case of this thesis topic the benefits outweighed the disadvantages. If steps are taken to avoid the potential downfalls of the interview, then it can be an effective method of acquiring information that may not otherwise be gained from other sources.

¹Ibid.

²Ibid.

³Ibid.

Chapter Three

Interview Analysis

After conducting the personal interviews it is necessary to analyze the information collected, in which similarities in responses as well as differences will be noted. Also, reflections of the respondents about their training and their suggestions for improvement are also recorded.

Five cantor/educators were interviewed for this portion of research, including three men and two women. Of these cantor/educators, three were professionally trained as cantors and educators and received degrees in both areas. One other respondent completed all course work towards the master in religious education but did not receive the degree due to the fact that she did not complete the required thesis. The fifth respondent was trained as cantor and did several things to train herself in the area of education, including twelve credits of education courses and periodic workshops, day courses, and mini courses.

When asked how their time is divided between the two roles, three respondents answered without hesitation that they definitely spent more of their time involved in educator related tasks. The fourth cantor/educator was not sure how his time was divided because he sees no clear definition between the two roles. The fifth respondent had a similar view. He sees his role of cantor/educator as a single job. He believes that he "is a cantor who, as part of his cantorate, is an educator."

Four of the five interviewees took on both roles from the beginning of their careers. Two knew from the beginning of their cantorial schooling that they wanted to be involved in the educational realm of the synagogue. One was hired as cantor/educator and the congregation made it clear that the school was the priority. Another felt he could affect more people and would have a greater impact on the Jewish community and Jewish life as a cantor/educator. He never saw himself solely as a musician. Although she had been interested in education, the fifth respondent served as cantor at a congregation on a part time basis. When the educator position was available in the same congregation she was offered the job.

When asked "If given a choice between the two roles, would you choose one job? If so, which one and why?," three interviewees responded that they would choose the cantorial role. Two of these said the reason was to stop bringing work home. The third said he finds more fulfillment from his role as cantor. He is "able to interface with people at various points in their lives," and he has "opportunities for sharing in life experiences with people as cantor that you do not have as educator." The other two cantor/educators would prefer to be an educator if given a choice. One because he no longer receives fulfillment from the performance part of the pulpit, perhaps, he says, because he does not have enough time in his schedule to study new music. Also, by the time Friday comes about, he is tired from the rest of the week and finds it difficult to motivate himself for services. For these reasons, he finds that he receives more enjoyment from his pastoral and educational duties.

The fifth respondent served only as cantor for ten years and missed being involved in education. By acting solely as cantor, he found that he was stuck in a role where he was seen as doing everything musical. However, he had skills and talents outside of music that he wanted to share. He probably would still choose to be involved in both the role of cantor and educator.

In speaking about the advantages of acting in the dual role of cantor/educator there were many similarities among the responses of the interviewees. Some of the advantages named include:

1. It gives elevated status to the cantorate because people assume the cantor knows more than just Jewish music and they take him/her more seriously. He/she is looked at as education professional and clergy.
2. It allows cantors to be in a smaller congregation and get to know people well.
3. It provides involvement with families on every level.
4. Cantor/educators feel very much a part of the congregation.
5. The role allows an individual to have a greater impact on congregation.
6. It provides opportunities to be involved in the community in ways other than music.
7. It allows individuals to use all skills and talents.
8. Cantor/educators do not have arguments with educators about liturgy in religious school.

All participants agreed that among the disadvantages of being both cantor and educator is a lack of time to get things done and constant fatigue. Also mentioned were the following:

1. Music takes a back seat.
2. It is difficult to do either role really well, which is a detriment to the congregation and the cantor.
3. There is a lack of support staff.
4. Cantor/educators often spend more time working than the rabbi but get paid less.
5. Cantor/educators often need to take work home.
6. Cantor/educators are always juggling the things that need to be done.

The respondents agree that the two roles complement each other in several ways. First, the role of the cantor involves more than just singing. It also includes pastoral and educational duties. A cantor is also a teacher, and this aspect complements the role of the educator. Second, a cantor/educator has more depth perception into the families' lives than a person performing only one of these roles. By being both the cantor and the educator, one can be involved in many more areas of a family's life. Also, it is easier to get to know people well by being so involved in their lives. The main conflict that the respondents have found is that partaking in both roles leaves little time to learn new music.

All participants agreed that good support staff is essential to being successful in both roles, whether in a large or a small congregation. The type of support staff varies among the

interviewees. One cantor/educator working in a synagogue of under 400 families has a secretary that works twenty hours per week, which is not enough help for the cantor and she ends up doing a lot of clerical work herself. Another cantor/educator in a synagogue of 280 families used religious school budget money to hire an administrative assistant for the school. There is also one secretary that not only does the work for the school and the cantor, but also the rabbi's correspondence, the bulletin, the bookkeeping, and any work for the Temple Board. It seems that the cantors working in larger congregations have more support staff usually consisting of a B'nai Mitzvah coordinator and/or tutors, an assistant principal/administrator, and a secretary.

It seems that in all of the situations dealt with in this section, the cantor/educator has some type of support staff for *B'nai Mitzvah* training. Even in the smallest congregation, the cantor has a tutor that sees the students before they begin with the cantor to make sure they can read Hebrew. In another congregation, the *B'nai Mitzvah* students are divided between the cantor and two tutors. In the larger congregations the cantor/educators are not as involved in the training of the students. One cantor teaches a trope class and the Torah and Haftarah portions while a tutor perfects the rest. Another meets with the students twice prior to the event to do rehearsals in the sanctuary, and tutors do the training. The last teaches a trope class and makes the tapes, but never meets with the students until they are on the *bimah*.

All participants agree that this dual role has an impact on their family life. Several of the respondents recognize that they are

"workaholics" and for this they are to blame. However, being the cantor/educator is a large job whether in a large or a small congregation. Work often takes precedence over family. Several of the participants found that having their spouse working in the synagogue was a solution to this problem. One respondent gave up the pulpit for a number of years to become the headmaster of his daughter's day school. This gave them the extra time they needed and he said they formed a wonderful bond from this experience.

When interviewees were asked if their education at HUC-JIR prepared them for their jobs, they all answered no. The respondents found a variety of ways to enhance their training. Several people found mentors that were helpful to them. Others took courses at other educational institutions available to them in their communities. There are various workshops offered for educators that many participants took advantage of over the years. The areas that the respondents said they could have used more training in include the following: rabbi relations, synagogue politics, text, Jewish Thought, more basic education courses for the cantor, supervision, Union of American Hebrew Congregations and its function and role in the synagogue, and the semantics of running a synagogue.

While there were many similarities among the responses, no two situations are identical. Therefore, there were many variations. One comment that was unanimous was that the dual role can not be performed successfully and efficiently without support staff.

Chapter Four

Conclusions

Skills Chart

	<u>CANTOR</u>			<u>EDUCATOR</u>		
	very helpful	helpful	not necessary	very helpful	helpful	not necessary
Basic teaching skills	X			X		
<u>Judaica</u> Bible, Hebrew, J. text	X			X		
History Philosophy	X			X		
liturgy	X				X	
Social skills	X			X		
Admin- istrative and organi- zational skills		X		X		
vocal training	X					X
Musical training	X					X
skills to teach music		X				X

Advanced
Ed.
Knowledge
learning
theory

X X

family
dynamics

X X

curricular
develop-
ment

X X

super-
vision

X X

evaluation

X X

teaching
method-
ologies

X X

B'nei
Mitzvah X
Teaching
Techniques

X

The roles of cantor and educator are compatible because some common skills and knowledge are needed for both. Most obviously, education is a large part of a cantor/educator's job and should be included in formal training. Basic teaching skills such as lesson plan writing, teaching styles, learning styles, methodology, and classroom management are essential. In addition, techniques for teaching *B'nei Mitzvah* students, differences in teaching various age groups, creative lesson plans, and teaching students with special needs are also needed. Both cantor and educator need a solid Judaica background including such areas as history, Bible, Hebrew, Jewish texts and, philosophy. The most difficult areas to teach are the practical elements of the cantor/educator's job. In the field,

cantor/educators have to deal with a variety of groups in the synagogue including the Temple Board, clergy, support staff, congregants and children. Skills for handling the issues that may arise with these groups need to be taught and developed.

Administrative and organizational skills are important for both a cantor and educator to have.

Though the roles of cantor and educator are compatible, there are some differences. Some skills needed are unique to the individual roles. In order to develop these skills people need to be trained appropriately. Based on responses in the interviews, some needed skills are not being taught in the institutions.

A cantor needs to be well trained in several areas that are different from an educator. Most importantly a cantor should have a pleasant voice. The fact that a cantor sings is what distinguishes him/her from a rabbi or educator, and, therefore, the cantor's voice should be trained. Second, the cantor is considered the musical expert in the synagogue and should be able to perform appropriately in this area. Professional training is needed in the following musical areas: Jewish musical style, Jewish music history, Reform and Traditional liturgy for Shabbat, High Holy Days and the Festivals, Jewish life cycle music, trope melodies for chanting Torah and Haftarah on Shabbat and the holidays, children's music, choral music, and other genre of Jewish song such as Yiddish, Ladino and Israeli Art song. Also, conducting a choir rehearsal, skills for teaching music to children and adults, and song leading skills are important elements of a cantor's training. In addition to the Judaica areas

mentioned for a cantor/educator, the cantor also needs to have a mastery level of the liturgy used in Reform congregations.

In addition, there are several skills that only an educator needs. It is important that the educator be knowledgeable about curriculum development, teaching methodologies, learning theory, evaluation, supervision, and staff development. Also, educators need to have a more detailed understanding of child development and family dynamics.

Recommendations for Future Training

Taking the responses of the interviewees and the preceding list of skills into consideration, several additions and changes to the existing course of study for a cantor/educator might be made. The program of study for attaining both master's degrees that is currently in use is difficult for a person to finish at the same time. There are several variables responsible for the difficulty. First, the course of study for the master of sacred music is very full. What used to be a five year bachelor program has been squeezed into a four year master program. In addition to the required courses, a cantor is required to study voice privately, research and write a master thesis, present a recital, and work in a student pulpit. Many students have teaching jobs as well, in order to help tackle the expense of living in New York City. With this heavy schedule it is difficult to take additional courses toward the master of education at the same time. Second, the requirements for the education

master's degree do not overlap with the cantorial requirements. For example, a cantor is required to take 21 additional credits in areas of Judaica. However, no courses taken in the cantorial program are allowed to be counted towards these 21 credits. This means that even though there are three history classes in the cantorial program one would still have to take others towards the Judaica credits. This makes a person feel like they are being punished for trying to complete the two degrees. Third, there is not a set course of study for someone completing both degrees. There are guidelines set up and the details of the individual students' program is left to the discretion of the Director of the School of Education in New York. At the Los Angeles campus, there is a structured program for a rabbinic student to complete the education degree. The rabbi/educator program is not nearly as burdensome as the cantor/educator program in New York.

I feel that the program for someone completing both the master of sacred music and the master's of religious education should be more structured than what currently exists. I do not see any reason that courses from both programs should not overlap. In my opinion, the core Judaica courses and basic education courses for rabbi, cantor, and educator should be the same. In addition, each specialty needs to provide courses that are specific to the needs of that group. For example, cantors would take music courses, rabbis might take more text courses and practical rabbinics, and educators would take additional education courses that might be more in depth than the basic courses taken by all students. This would prevent a

student from repetition of courses and make more efficient use of their time in the program.

The respondents made some suggested additions to the program. First, additional text courses are needed. Not only studying the texts, but also how to teach texts and how texts may be used in the classroom. It is not enough to know Jewish texts if cantor/educators do not know how to teach texts and pass them on to their students. Second, the college should teach techniques for teaching students with special needs. Third, the curriculum should include the practical aspects of working in a synagogue such as running a Temple, how the board works, the function of the UAHC in the synagogue, staff relations and, Temple politics. Fourth, course work should include a focus on improving communication skills. Cantor/educators need to develop skills for communicating with parents, teachers, staff, students, colleagues, and board members.

Proposal for Training

This proposal for the training of cantor/educators is centered around the cantorial program that is currently in place. My suggestions for change and those of the interviewees are included in this proposal.

	Fall Semester	Spring Semester
<u>Year-in-Israel</u>	Hebrew Grammar Bible	cont. cont. cont.

Land/People of Israel	cont.
liturgy	cont.
Midrash	Mishnah
cantillation	cont.
Jewish modes	Hist. of Jewish music
sight singing *	
voice lessons**	
coaching **	

* students should be given a test in the beginning of the year to determine whether or not they need to take this course.

** voice lessons and coaching will be required for all five years.

Year 2

Beginning Education	Education
Medieval Jewish Hist.	Liturgy
Bible	cont.
Hebrew	cont.
Harmonization of modes	Shabbat (reform)
Shabbat nusach (Trad.)	cont.
Daily and Life cycle	cont.
High Holy Days (Reform)	cont.
music education/guitar	cont.
choir	cont.

Summer 1

How to Teach Jewish Text
Confluent Education

Summer courses would meet for 3 hours each week for six to eight weeks.

Year 3

High Holy Day liturgy	Hist. of the Cantorate
Biblical History	cont.
Modern Jewish History	Research
Modern Jewish Thought	Midrash
Special Topics in Education	
M.A.R.E Seminar	cont. *

anthems	Festivals nusach (Reform)	life cycles and
	Rosh Hashana nusach (Trad.)	cont.
	choir	cont.

*M.A.R.E. Seminar should be a seminar including practical topics for educators in brief sessions. Some suggestions include:

- Budget
- Grants
- Students with special needs
- Resume
- Clergy/educator relations
- Family dynamics
- Creating Teacher manuals
- Creating Parent manuals
- Social Action as part of the curriculum
- The purpose, function and history of the UAHC
- Jewish organizations --JUF, JNF, JCB, JCC
- Temple politics
- Types of High School programs
- B'nei Mitzvah techniques/curriculum
- What's involved in running a temple
- Communication skills

Summer 2

Creative Arts in Education
Philosophy of Jewish Education

Year 4

Educational Psychology	Human Relations
Administrative and Organizational Skills	
Programming	cont.
Senior Seminar	cont.
Yiddish Art Song	Ladino/Israeli Music
Festivals (Trad.)	cont.
Selichot/Yom Kippur (Trad.)	cont.
Cantorial Thesis	

Year 5

Curriculum development
 Supervision/staff development
 Social/Philosophical Foundations of Education
 Educational Thesis*

* The topic for the Education Thesis will be connected in some way to the cantorial thesis. This should decrease the amount of work a little, especially in the research stage.

In an essay entitled "Preparing New Educational Professionals for Nonpublic School Settings," Robert Nash and Edward Ducharme describe the alternative educator who does not choose to teach in a public school, but rather works in education as it interfaces with human service programs, public policy decisions and other similar programs. In many ways their model resembles ours in as much as we are both concerned with training role models and educators who can see the broader implications of their work. They write:

The new educational professional must be both a specialist and a generalist, competent in the pedagogical skills and understanding, but also adept at applying these skills in various educational settings. As a specialist, he must function, on the job and off, with learners of differing ages, backgrounds, and needs. As a generalist, he must apply educational principles and procedures in fields and settings where there is little or no precedent for them.¹

¹Judy R. Israel, "The Recruitment, Training and Retention of Jewish Educators," To Build a Jewish Profession: Careers in Jewish Education, ed. Joseph Reimer, (Massachusetts: Brandeis University, 1987), 118-119.

Because we want to attract to Jewish education the type of individual who is not just Jewish in the classroom but who also provides a positive role model for students in general, we need to think of training as helping to create more than a classroom teacher. Nash and Ducharme provide five criteria for the kind of educator we should be training.

1. Educators should be able to develop, clarify, enlarge and present information, ideas and meanings to others.
2. Educators should realize that teaching styles need to be as diverse as learning styles and that learning is a life-long endeavor which requires change over time.
3. Educators should be trained to be "thoughtfully eclectic" and acquire skills and understanding in a variety of areas through careful study and systematic acquisitions of many views and methodologies.
4. Educators must be able to aid students in understanding and reinterpreting their own identities and in learning from those reinterpretations. One question must be asked constantly: What kind of society is the educator helping students to face and adapt to?
5. A competent educator is also a competent helper, thus demanding an increase in the counseling skills and psychological training of new educators.¹

The role of the cantor/educator is important and they can be most effective and successful with proper training. Hopefully, with

¹Ibid. 119.

input from other cantor/educators in the field the college will reevaluate the course of study for people interested in merging the two professional roles.

In some sense, education is part of every cantor's job. However, some cantors do not care for that part of their job, are not comfortable in a teaching role, or just do not perform well in this role. On the other hand, there are many cantors who excel as educators and should be encouraged to pursue additional training in this field. Especially now, when so many congregations are hiring cantor/educators, it is important to prepare these people well for their jobs in the field.

The research for this thesis focused on the cantor/educator's perspective on their roles in synagogues. More can be learned by researching lay and professional leadership in congregations who employ cantor/educators. They would offer an additional important perspective on their motivations for hiring cantor/educators as well as provide an insider's view towards the advantages and disadvantages of one person performing both roles.

APPENDIX IInterview Questions

Name _____

Date _____

Phone _____

Families in Congregation _____

students in RS _____

1. Were you trained to be both Cantor and Educator?
2. Generally, how is your time divided between the two roles?
3. What do you find to be the advantages of taking on both the role of cantor and educator? Disadvantages?
4. How do the two roles complement each other? How do they conflict with each other?
5. Did you take on the other job because of your need for the job or because of a love for the other job?
6. Do you feel your education prepared you for this job?
7. If not, where or in what area could you have used more training/guidance?
8. If you had a preference would you do one job full time? If so, which one and why?
9. If there is a conflict between the two jobs which one takes precedence and why?
10. What kind of support staff is provided for you in order to facilitate both jobs?
11. In what way does the dual role impact on your family life?
12. Does using your voice to run school functions affect your voice for holidays or Shabbat?

13. Does having to run the school cut into time to learn new music?

14. What is your role in B'nei Mitzvah training?

What do you do as a cantor?

1. give the shema prayer and the kaddish prayer and the shema prayer and the kaddish prayer
2. give the shema prayer and the kaddish prayer and the shema prayer and the kaddish prayer
3. Because he does both roles more active than before in community.

Disadvantages?

After 24 years in field, he's tired
 - conflicts to get turned on by hearing new programs and shaping Jewish
 education of kids

APPENDIX II

Biographical Data of Respondents and Interviews

Respondent A

Respondent A is a male cantor/educator working in a southeastern metropolitan city. His congregation has 732 families with approximately 600 children in the religious school. He estimates that he educates 1000 individuals weekly. He was invested in 1973.

Interview

Families in Congregation --732

students in RS --K-7th=394, Preschool=110, 8-12th=105,
Day School (not in RS)=100, Adult Ed.=300

1. Were you trained to be both Cantor and Educator?

BA in Greek History for secondary education
Master in Educational Administration

2. Generally, how is your time divided between the two roles?

Sees as single job- he's a cantor who as part of his cantorate does education
30hrs. school, 30-40 hrs. cantor/counselor/musician, 20 hrs. pastoral,
teaching

3. What do you find to be the advantages of taking on both the role of cantor and educator?

1. gives elevated status to cantorate - people assume you know more than Jewish music, take you seriously, able to handle text.

2. gives entres to community other than music. he's able to effect Jewish education in ---- because of educator role.

3. Because he does both roles more active than rabbis in community

Disadvantages?

After 24 years in field, he's tired.

continues to get turned on by creating new programs and shaping Jewish education of kids

4. How do the two roles complement each other?

no answer

How do they conflict with each other?

no answer

5. Did you take on the other job because of your need for the job or because of a love for the other job?

Felt could affect more people and would have greater impact on Jewish community and Jewish life. Never saw himself solely as a musician.

6. Do you feel your education prepared you for this job?

Probably not. HUC education - no! Worked with good mentors over the years. Part of CIJE's TIA program. Taken more courses over the years.

7. If not, where or in what area could you have used more training/guidance?

text, Jewish thought, more basic ed for cantor (creative lessons, teaching styles, supervision)

8. If you had a preference would you do one job full time? If so, which one and why?

Cantor full time - more fulfillment, broader
"interface with people at various points in lives"
opportunities for sharing in life experiences with people as cantor but not as educator

9. If there is a conflict between the two jobs which one takes precedence and why?

depends on conflict - funeral always takes precedence.
If you make your schedule there shouldn't be any conflicts

10. What kind of support staff is provided for you in order to facilitate both jobs?

large support team can take on day to day administration of school
can't be sole person doing everything

He has:

4 BM tutors	jr. choir director	torah chant tutor
asst. principal/administrator		full time secretary for both roles

11. In what way does the dual role impact on your family life?

very understanding spouse
strains, he's a workaholic - 100 hrs./wk.
gave up pulpit and was headmaster of daughter's day school (then back to congregation)

12. Does using your voice to run school functions affect your voice for holidays or Shabbat?
no. never yells
13. Does having to run the school cut into time to learn new music?
yes. absolutely
14. What is your role in B'nei Mitzvah training?
limited.
- BM coordinator
2 chanting tutors
2 Hebrew tutors
Rabbi meets with BM student 3 times prior to BM
Cantor meets with BM student 2 times prior to BM

Respondent B

Respondent B is a female cantor/educator working in the Boston area. Her congregation has about 280 families with approximately 140 students in the religious school. She was invested in 1988.

Interview

# Families in Congregation	280
# students in RS	140

1. Were you trained to be both Cantor and Educator?
Did cantorial program in its entirety. Did education courses but did not do thesis.
2. Generally, how is your time divided between the two roles?
80% educator 20% cantor
3. What do you find to be the advantages of taking on both the role of cantor and educator?
able to be in a smaller congregation and get to know all the people

Disadvantages?

don't get to do either role really well. Detriment to congregation and cantor finances - not as much money as people she graduated with
not enough support staff

4. How do the two roles complement each other?
get to know people well

How do they conflict with each other?

when first class in Fall is the day before Rosh Hashanah
sometimes big events are back to back

5. Did you take on the other job because of your need for the job or because of a love for the other job?
hired as cantor/ed and congregation made it clear that the school was the priority

6. Do you feel your education prepared you for this job?
no

7. If not, where or in what area could you have used more training/guidance?
semantics of running of a Temple- how board works, UAHC

8. If you had a preference would you do one job full time? If so, which one and why?
If change jobs would like to be cantor full time

9. If there is a conflict between the two jobs which one takes precedence and why?
depends. If not critical for her to be there then she's not. Often life cycle events take precedence.

10. What kind of support staff is provided for you in order to facilitate both jobs?
Administrative assistant for school (used her budget money to pay salary)
1 secretary for Temple bulletin, bookkeeper, school needs, cantor needs, rabbi correspondence and Board needs

11. In what way does the dual role impact on your family life?
Tough - worked all the time
Her husband would say "we need you here" and that was her check point

12. Does using your voice to run school functions affect your voice for holidays or Shabbat?
yes

13. Does having to run the school cut into time to learn new music?
yes

14. What is your role in B'nei Mitzvah training?
16 a year - divide amongst 3 tutors including cantor -paid extra for this
Cantor:
trains 5-8 a year start to finish
makes tapes for all
does 1-2 sessions in sanctuary for all
tutors report back to cantor and rabbi

Respondent C

Respondent C is a male cantor/educator working in the Philadelphia area. His congregation has approximately 850 families with about 600 students in the religious school. He was invested in 1977.

Interview

Families in Congregation 850
students in RS 592

1. Were you trained to be both Cantor and Educator?
yes. graduated SSM in 1977, technically no ed degree
2. Generally, how is your time divided between the two roles?
70% school 30% cantorial
3. What do you find to be the advantages of taking on both the role of cantor and educator?
impact on congregation is greater than cantors
viewed as educational professional and clergy (status)
helps to get along with rabbi

he prefers supervisory to actual teaching-his forte is more administrative

Disadvantages?

never enough time
lots of juggling of time
music takes a back seat--1 or 2 new pieces a year

4. How do the two roles complement each other?
role of cantor more than just singing --pastoral, educational
being able to build on that

How do they conflict with each other?
running school gets in the way of music

5. Did you take on the other job because of your need for the job or because of a love for the other job?
knew from the beginning that he wanted to do both jobs

6. Do you feel your education prepared you for this job?
yes and no

7. If not, where or in what area could you have used more training/guidance?
rabbi relations, practical stuff, politics

8. If you had a preference would you do one job full time? If so, which one and why?
educational- not feeling fulfillment from performance part of pulpit. Maybe because the music get cut out or because he's so tired on Fridays that it's hard to get revved up. He enjoys the pastoral and educational aspects of his job.

9. If there is a conflict between the two jobs which one takes precedence and why?
depends. funerals do.

10. What kind of support staff is provided for you in order to facilitate both jobs?

BM coordinator
P/T assistant principal-runs assemblies, programs, fills in for cantor
P/T secretary shared with rabbi (not good situation)
In his next contract he wants to negotiate for an administrative assistant

11. In what way does the dual role impact on your family life?
Usually home at 11pm and never before 9pm. Goes to work by 9am
He's at the Temple Sat. morning before services and Sun. before Religious School
Wife says it's his fault, but he takes pride in what he does.

12. Does using your voice to run school functions affect your voice for holidays or Shabbat?
not really
13. Does having to run the school cut into time to learn new music?
yes
14. What is your role in B'nei Mitzvah training?
70-90 BM/year
not important for him to take up his time training them
Assistant Principal became BM coordinator with staff of 3 tutors she supervises
Cantor teaches cantillation class
makes tapes for students
Cantor is not satisfied with the quality of work that is done.

Respondent D

Respondent D is a female cantor/educator working in a smaller congregation in the New Jersey/New York area. Her congregation has about 400 families with 188 students in the religious school. She was invested in 1989.

Interview

Families in Congregation 400
students in RS 188

1. Were you trained to be both Cantor and Educator?
trained as cantor, has 12 credits toward education. Found it impossible to do both in four years. Continually educating herself through workshops, day courses and mini-courses.
2. Generally, how is your time divided between the two roles?
spends more time in school than on cantorial duties
3. What do you find to be the advantages of taking on both the role of cantor and educator?
-more involved with families on every level

-feels very much a part of the congregation

Disadvantages?

- parts of cantorial job that she gives up - no life cycle (except Bar Mitzvah) and she would like to be involved in family's lives, feels emotionally bound
- she is sometimes moved to do things not part of her contract (condolence letters)
- takes a lot of work home
- creativity goes into the school
- limited time to learn new music, sermons-in-song

4. How do the two roles complement each other?

she has more depth perception of family's lives (more than rabbi)
hands-on with 6th/7th grade leading services

How do they conflict with each other?

no answer

5. Did you take on the other job because of your need for the job or because of a love for the other job?

she was interested in education but at the time, she needed the job. Her cantorial position was not full time.

6. Do you feel your education prepared you for this job?

no. she continually used Dr. Blumberg as a resource in the beginning for guidance and advice, especially for administrative things. She is very organized. Always educating herself. "She is not a teacher but an administrator. If she can't help teachers she brings in someone who can."

7. If not, where or in what area could you have used more training/guidance?

no answer

8. If you had a preference would you do one job full time? If so, which one and why?

she would choose to be only a cantor.

she could stop bringing work home and stop receiving phone calls at home

9. If there is a conflict between the two jobs which one takes precedence and why?

never a conflict because of terms of her contract (no life cycle)

10. What kind of support staff is provided for you in order to facilitate both jobs?

she has a 20 hr/wk secretary

needs more hours of help. As the cantor she ends up doing lots of clerical.

11. In what way does the dual role impact on your family life?

It's terrible - she is a single parent with 1 child
 work goes home, phone calls at home
 Rabbi stands behind her in choices that support family

12. Does using your voice to run school functions affect your voice for holidays or Shabbat?
 always has to preserve voice for end of the week
 Rabbi good about making sure school hours are what she can handle for HHD
13. Does having to run the school cut into time to learn new music?
 yes.
14. What is your role in B'nei Mitzvah training?
 she does all 1on1 sessions
 has 1 tutor to make sure kids can read Hebrew
 she basically does everything.

Respondent E

Respondent E is a male cantor/educator at a large congregation in the midwest. His congregation has approximately 700 families with about 280 students in the religious school. He was invested in 1974.

Interview

Families in Congregation 700
 # students in RS 280

1. Were you trained to be both Cantor and Educator?
 yes.
2. Generally, how is your time divided between the two roles?
 not sure. no clear definition. lots of community education.

3. What do you find to be the advantages of taking on both the role of cantor and educator?

able to use all of his skills
lots of possibilities in different areas
freedom to put together the program he wants/needs
doesn't have to argue with educator about liturgy in hebrew school

Disadvantages?

only 24 hrs. in a day
\$ - works more hours than rabbi with less pay

4. How do the two roles complement each other?

no answer

How do they conflict with each other?

no answer

5. Did you take on the other job because of your need for the job or because of a love for the other job?

In school fell in love with education and wanted to pursue it.

6. Do you feel your education prepared you for this job?

HUC - no. He took courses at Bank Street College.

7. If not, where or in what area could you have used more training/guidance?

no answer.

8. If you had a preference would you do one job full time? If so, which one and why?

He was a cantor for 10 years and missed being involved in education. He got stuck in a role where he only took on the musical aspects of the synagogue. He felt that he had more skills and talents that he wanted to share.

9. If there is a conflict between the two jobs which one takes precedence and why?

no answer.

10. What kind of support staff is provided for you in order to facilitate both jobs?

He has a school administrator

11. In what way does the dual role impact on your family life?

Tough. His wife became a Hebrew teacher so they would see each other more.

12. Does using your voice to run school functions affect your voice for holidays or Shabbat?

Not really. He wouldn't do before singing. He has no specific teaching responsibilities. All of his work gets done before school starts. chooses music accordingly.

13. Does having to run the school cut into time to learn new music?

no. He is not the administrator and he has time.

14. What is your role in B'nei Mitzvah training?

He developed the program.

He developed the curriculum so that in High School the last year uses *siddur* as text. A tutor perfects the prayerbook requirements.

He meets with students 14 times doing Torah and Haftarah, some chant, some not
He teaches a trope class

Union of American Hebrew Congregations

Conference of Presidents of Major American Jewish Organizations

Confidentiality Relationship with the LAMC Board of

Trustees and the AOC, 1988

Zeldin, Michael. "Rethinking Jewish Education." Reform Judaism

Spring 1995: 51.

THE YIVO LIBRARY
JEWISH ARCHIVES
JEWISH UNIVERSITY OF AMERICA
BRANDERSON LIBRARY
1 WEST 4TH STREET
NEW YORK, NY 10014

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Good, Carter V. Essentials of Educational Research: Methodology and Design. New York: Appleton-Century Crofts, 1972.

Goodman, Roberta Louis. "The Changing Role of the Jewish Educator: Where We Came From and Where We Are Going." Compass Fall 1994: 15.

Hoffman, Lawrence A. "Cantors and Soloists." Koleinu May 1996: 1.

Holtz, Barry W. "Schools That Succeed." Reform Judaism Spring 1995: 56.

Reimer, Joseph, ed. To Build a Profession: Careers in Jewish Education. Massachusetts: Brandeis University, 1987.

Union of American Hebrew Congregations and The American Conference of Cantors. Guidelines for Cantorial-Congregational Relationships. New York: UAHC Board of Trustees and the ACC, 1989.

Zeldin, Michael. "Rethinking Jewish Education." Reform Judaism Spring 1995: 51.

THE KLAU LIBRARY
HEBREW UNION COLLEGE-
JEWISH INSTITUTE OF RELIGION
BROOKDALE CENTER
1 WEST 4TH STREET
NEW YORK, NY 10012