



LIBRARY COPYRIGHT NOTICE

www.huc.edu/libraries

Regulated Warning

See Code of Federal Regulations, Title 37, Volume 1, Section 201.14:

The copyright law of the United States (title 17, United States Code) governs the making of photocopies or other reproductions of copyrighted material.

Under certain conditions specified in the law, libraries and archives are authorized to furnish a photocopy or other reproduction. One of these specific conditions is that the photocopy or reproduction is not to be “used for any purpose other than private study, scholarship, or research.” If a user makes a request for, or later uses, a photocopy or reproduction for purposes in excess of “fair use,” that user may be liable for copyright infringement.

This institution reserves the right to refuse to accept a copying order if, in its judgment, fulfillment of the order would involve violation of copyright law.

INSTRUCTIONS TO LIBRARY FOR THESES AND PRIZE ESSAYS

Statement by
Referee

AUTHOR Daniel F. Polish

TITLE "Al T'Hi Ka'Avotecha" A Translation

(Not Necessary
for Ph.D.
Thesis)

TYPE OF THESIS: Ph.D. ☐ D.H.L. ☐ Rabbinic ☒
Master's ☐ Prize Essay ☐

1) May (with revisions) be considered for Publication

☒ ☐
yes no

2) May circulate ☒

3) Is restricted ☐

August 7, 1967
Date

Isidore H. Petrushevsky
Signature of Referee

Statement by
Author

(Please consult with Librarian if copyright protection
is desired.)

I understand that the Library may make a photocopy of
my thesis for security purposes.

The Library may sell photocopies of my thesis. ☒ ☐
yes no

August 1, 1967
Date

Daniel F. Polish
Signature of Author

Library
Record

Microfilmed 5/68
Date

Melina Steiner
Signature of Library Staff Member

AL T'HI KA - AVOTECHA

A TRANSLATION

DANIEL F. POLISH

Thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the
Degree of Master of Arts in Hebrew Letters and Ordination.

HEBREW UNION COLLEGE - JEWISH INSTITUTE OF RELIGION

1 9 6 8

D I G E S T

In the late fourteenth century, Profiat Duran wrote Al T'hi Ka-avotecha, an ironic analysis of the Christian religion. In this thesis I have attempted to translate the work into English. To this end I have read all extant texts of the letter and have based my translation on the most lucid elements of the texts printed by Heilpern and Geiger - forming, in this way, a sort of scientific translation. Since I have relied most heavily on the Heilpern version, I have included a complete translation of the Geiger text in an appendix. I have also included copies of both texts in Hebrew.

I have sought to clarify as well as translate this polemic and have, therefore, included, in footnotes, citations of textual references and explanatory remarks. I have given, in the introduction, background material about the letter and its historic circumstances. In all I have tried to give as complete an understanding as possible about this most valuable document.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

Introduction	Page 1-5
History of the letter	Page 6-8
Personae	Page 9-13
Note on the text used in the translation	Page 14-15

TRANSLATION OF THE LETTER	Page 16-37
---------------------------	------------

APPENDICES

Appendix A Translation of the Geiger Text	Page 38-53
Appendix B The Heilpern text	Page 54-64
Appendix C The Geiger text	Page 65-72

BIBLIOGRAPHY	Page 73
--------------	---------

INTRODUCTION

INTRODUCTION

In a world where eccumenism is the mode of the day, we often forget that ours is not the only style of inter-religious communication. Men have extended their arms before, not to embrace, but to smite. We recall, with anguish, the monuments to human bestiality that the Middle Ages erected as its mode of "dialogue"; the Crusades; the Inquisition; the disputas; the expulsions. And yet the hatred and suspicion was not embodied in the savagery of these assaults, it was embodied in the intent of assault itself. Distrust need not find such dramatic expressions. It can find refuge in the simple written word. The polemic as well as the sword was a valued weapon in the arsenal of contempt.

Al T'hi Ka-avotecha was not the first polemic penned in the Middle Ages. Christians had been letting fly at each other with these arrows for centuries before it was written. Polemics against Judaism were common by the time of its composition. Even Jewish polemics against Christianity were a familiar phenomenon by its publication. But Al T'hi Ka-avotecha remains an important document because, "in the entire history of Judeo-Christian controversy no such stinging satire had been produced on the Jewish side as that... issued by the physician, astronomer, historical student and grammarian Profiat Duran."¹ It is important if for no other reason than as an
1 Graetz, Heinrich, History of the Jews, Philadelphia, Jewish Publication Society, 1894.

archetype of its genre.

But its sharp, pungent satire gives more than an insight into the current philosophies of religious thought. It gives the feel of the underlying religious symbiosis. It reveals history as unfolded to the participant. And it thrusts us headlong, perhaps unwillingly, into an entire style of life. It is not really a historical monument. But it is the mortar and brick of which such monuments are built.

As a literary composition Al T'hi Ka-avotecha should not only be studied and understood. It should be savored and enjoyed. For "in all medieval Hebrew prose there is hardly another work so concise, polished, and direct in style."² This praise does not refer to Duran's writing ability alone. He has challenged the reader's erudition with a remarkable marshalling of textual quotations. He has culled strikingly relevant selections from the Bible, Talmud, Midrash and Siddur and has woven them into the fabric of the whole so skillfully that no seams are visible. The result is a fascinating tapestry. As a literary creation alone, Al T'hi Ka-avotecha is a work of consummate mastery and as such is to be enjoyed.

But the real pleasure of reading the letter comes in the confrontation of an agile and subtle mind. Duran has mastered the art of teaching by indirection. He does not lecture us. He does

2 Baer, Yitzhak, A History of the Jews in Christian Spain, Philadelphia, Jewish Publication Society, 1961. Volume II page 151.

not spell out the subject of his remarks or his intent. Instead he uses sarcasm and irony to force us to teach ourselves. We must, ourselves, make explicit the essentially implicit thrust of his remarks. Thus, his letter rises above being a petty exercise in contentiousness, and becomes a challenge to the reader's alertness, an interesting puzzle. We have to work hard to understand Duran. But such labor heightens our appreciation of a message which might be familiar. Indeed, his style and his use of texts often compensate for teachings which might otherwise be regarded as banal.

The major theme of the letter is, of course, the conflict between faith and reason. Christianity, claims Duran, rests solely on faith --on accepting what one is taught, even if such teachings be patently illogical. Judaism, on the other hand, is a religion of reason. Nothing in it is contrary to logic or science. Indeed, Judaism is predicated on a scientific understanding of the universe and a logical presentation of that understanding. In Judaism faith and reason can co-exist.

The modus of the letter is to analyze aspects of the Christian faith and show how they are blatantly contrary to reason. This Duran does through subtle innuendo rather than explicit derogation. He expresses himself through generous use of irony and the letter is dominated by his intensely sarcastic rendition of Christian dogma. The implication is constant. How can you prefer this illogical doctrine

to Judaism, the faith of reason?

It must be pointed out that the picture of Judaism painted by Duran was not necessarily the normative definition accepted by his contemporaries. Less than a hundred years before Duran wrote this letter, the study of philosophy was banned by the Jewish community of Barcelona:

From this day on and for the next fifty years no member of our community shall study the "Greek" works on science and metaphysics either in the original (i. e. in Arabic) or in translation, before he shall have reached the age of twenty-five; nor may any member of our community teach the aforesaid disciplines to anyone under the age of twenty-five, lest these studies draw the student away from the Torah of Israel which is superior to this learning. . . .³

In Duran's own lifetime, R. Shemtob ibn Shemtob wrote:

When I examined the writings (of the various philosophers) . . . a flame was kindled within me, for a vile plague has spread among the children of Israel. For what I saw was that it has ever been the great scientific investigators who are the deniers and apostates. Nor can there be any doubt that the affliction and apostasy which have befallen us together with the ruin of our communities, derive from these philosophers and sophists who have sinned against the protecting tabernacle and breached the hedge (of Torah) . . .⁴

Duran was a disciple of Crescas and an outstanding commentator on Maimonides. In a sense he was not only defending rationalist Judaism against dogmatic Christianity. He was also advocating a philosophical approach to Judaism itself in the face of many who

³ Ibid. vol. I p. 130.

⁴ Ibid. vol. II p. 236f.

rejected such an orientation. Duran, himself, made sure that his letter was circulated within the Jewish community. In a sense it might have been directed to that community as much as to Christianity. His implicit message may have been that by advocating an anti-rationalistic faith his co-religionists were no better than their Christian neighbors. Faith is no weapon against faith. Reason was the only sound armament to ward off the theological assaults. Whatever its true intent, Al T'hi Ka-avotecha remains a fascinating and compelling document.

HISTORY OF THE LETTER

The origins of Al T'hi Ka-avotecha are shrouded in myth. Within a few generations after the event a legend had developed around the contents of the letter "based partly on guess work and erroneous reconstruction."⁵ This myth was set into print in both the commentary by Joseph ben Shem Tob and the introduction by Isaac Akrish that accompanied the letter in its very first edition (1554). In that introduction Akrish wrote:

This is the letter sent from Avignon to Don Meir Alguades the rabbi of all the Jews in the kingdom of Castile. The circumstances of the letter are that there were two forced converts in Aragon, the name of the first was Maestro Profiat (Duran) and the name of the second was Bonet Bonjorn. They decided together to go to Eretz Israel and to become Jewish there. Profiat set out first. But Bonet Bonjorn postponed the journey twice. In the meantime there came to Avignon one Paul--whose name had formerly been Don Solomon Halevi--in order to be a proselytizer. He found Bonet Bonjorn "the Christian" there and argued with him and caused him to change his mind. Bonet Bonjorn wrote Profiat about this and never saw him (again). From his reply we know a little of the circumstances. This is a copy of the reply that Profiat sent to his friend Bonet Bonjorn.⁶

Actually, we cannot begin to deduce this story from the reading of the letter. And of late much doubt has been raised about its authenticity. Yitzhak Baer in particular doubts that Duran could have been a forced convert:

5 Ibid. Vol. II p. 151.

6 Akrish's introduction as published in Kobez Wikkuhim Breslau 1844.

It is inconceivable that a man who clung so loyally to his religion and fought on its behalf with such determination should, only a short time previously have paid obeisance to alien gods. Nor is it likely that were he a converso, the Church would have allowed him to live as a Jew and publish anti-Christian polemics over a period of twenty-five years:⁷

We can be sure however, that, whatever his personal history, Duran did write this letter in response to some document he himself had received. His intent is obviously to cause those who had left the faith of Israel to return for:

The salvation and redemption that we hope for include all the seed of Abraham, both they upon whom apostasy was forced so that they were broken and ensnared and captured, and they who subscribe with their hand unto the Lord and surname themselves of Israel (i.e. proselytes) (Isaiah 44:5).⁸

The letter is believed to have been composed in 1396, five years after Duran is said to have been forced to convert. He did not send it to his friend Bonet Bonjorn alone. But, as Akrish mentions, he sent a copy to Don Meir Alguades a physician to the King of Castile and the chief rabbi of the Jews in that kingdom. Don Meir Alguades took it upon himself to circulate the letter.⁹ The letter was not published in printed form until 1554. In that year it was set in type in Constantinople with the already mentioned introduction by Isaac Akrish and Joseph Ben Shem Tob (who lived shortly after the composition of the letter: 1400-1460).¹⁰

7 Baer, op. cit. vol. II p. 152.

8 Duran as quoted in Baer, loc. cit. volume 2 page 157.

9 Graetz, Heinrich, History of the Jews, Philadelphia, Jewish Publication Society, 1894, volume 4, page 190.

10 Kayserling, Meyer, "Profiat Duran", Jewish Encyclopedia, New York, Funk and Wagnalls, 1903 vol. 5, p. 16.

The letter was not re-printed for nearly three hundred years. It was first republished in 1840 by Abraham Geiger in his Melo Chofnajim. Essentially this same manuscript was reproduced in the collection Kobez Wikkuhim in 1844. The second scientific edition was brought out in 1846 by P. Heilpern in Eben Boħan part 2. It was translated into German by Geiger in Wissenschaftliche Zeitschrift IV p. 451.¹⁰

One interesting sidelight about the history of the letter itself is that so successful had Duran been in his subtle irony that the Church itself mistook the intent of his composition and used it under the name Alteca Boteca as an apologia in its own behalf. Years later when the real intent was discovered it was made the subject of a judicial inquiry and condemned to the flames.¹¹

10 Kayserling, Meyer, "Profiat Duran", Jewish Encyclopedia, New York, Funk and Wagnalls, 1903 vol. 5, p. 16.

11 Graetz, loc. cit.

PERSONAE

Profiat Duran

Duran was born in the last half of the fourteenth century as Isaac ben Moshe Halevi. His parents were French. As a young man he studied Talmud at a school in Germany. Even then he gave clues about his later vocation for, against the opposition of his teachers, he broadened his course of studies to include philosophy and science.¹² On his return to Spain Duran became a disciple and close associate of Hasdai Crescas. He is known to have differed with his master and taken a more moderate stand between philosophy and tradition.¹³ In fact this sympathy to tradition can be seen in Al T'hi K'avotecha where he designates not only philosophy but also observance of the mitsvot as indicative of normative Judaism. His underlying piety can also be seen in a statement he made in his work Ma'aseh Efod:

Who can say that the survival of the communities of Aragon, which are the essence of what remains to us in the Spanish exile, was not due to their diligence in prayer, their rising in night vigils to supplicate to the Lord, their reliance on the sayings of the scriptures and their hymns from the book of Psalms?¹⁴

Al T'hi K'avotecha is said to be his first book, though its style indicates earlier practice. In 1395 he wrote a treatise on mathematics and calendrics called Hesheb Ha'efod. It was from the title of this book

12 Kayserling, loc. cit.

13 Baer, loc. cit.

14 Quoted in Baer, Ibid. 'p. 114.

that he took his nom de plum, Efodi, a mnemonic for ani Profiat Duran. Two years later at the urging of his master, Crescas, he wrote a more thorough and lengthy analysis of the Christian religion. In this book, Kelimath Hagoyim, he gives a straight-forward historical review of many of the major tenets of Christianity as he knew it.¹⁵ He dedicated this book to his teacher Hasdai Crescas.¹⁶ He also wrote a critical grammar, Ma'aseh Efod, and a history of Jewish Martyrdom, Zikron Hashemadot. But he is best remembered for his commentary to Maimonides' Moreh Nebuchim.¹⁶ In 1413 he is mentioned as having been at the disputa at Tortosa, though no official capacity is mentioned.¹⁷ After that he disappears from the record of history, leaving only his literary handiwork behind as a memorial.

Magister David Bonet Bonjorn

We would expect to find David Bonet Bonjorn in the historical records. But, in fact, he seems to exist only as the recipient of Duran's famous letter. Nothing more is known about him save that he was a member of a well-known family of physicians in Perpignan.¹⁸ Even in Duran's polemic he seems nothing more than a foil for the author's wit or a masque for the real target of the letter, Paul of Burgos, the converso par excellence.

¹⁵ Ibid. p. 151

¹⁶ Kayserling, loc. cit.

¹⁷ Baron, Salo Wittmayer, A Social and Religious History of the Jews, second edition, New York, Columbia University Press, 1965, vol. IX p. 90.

¹⁸ Baer, loc. cit.

Paul of Burgos

It might be expected that in a letter the only two people involved would be the sender and the recipient. Such is not the case here, however. For in the dim background of the exchange stands a figure well known to historians of the Middle Ages. Indeed, it can easily be surmised that he is the real object of Duran's remarks.

Born Solomon Halevi of Burgos in 1351, he was one of the most wealthy and prominent Jews in Burgos.¹⁹ He was well versed in the Bible, Talmud, and rabbinic literature.²⁰ He was a member of an important circle of Jewish Castilian intellectuals²¹ and had even served as a rabbi.²⁰ Yet, despite this background he was to become "the foremost converso in that period of apostasy."²² On July 21, 1391, in the midst of a great persecution, Don Solomon Halevi converted to Christianity²³ and became Paul Burgensis or Paul de Santa Maria.²⁴ It is known that his brothers and children, four sons and a daughter, were converted with him.²⁵ Accounts vary whether his wife converted later²³ or remained a Jewess until the day of her death.²⁵

Paul maintained that he was converted because of a sincere commitment nurtured in him by the reading of Aquinas.²⁶ Others suggest that his conversion had something to do with his own great

19 Kayserling, Meyer, "Paul of Burgos", Jewish Encyclopedia op. cit. vol. 9, page 562.

20 Graetz, op. cit. vol. 4 p. 183.

21 Baer, op. cit. vol. I p. 377.

22 Ibid. vol. II p. 139.

23 Ibid. vol. II p. 141.

24 Graetz, op. cit. p. 182.

25 Kayserling, loc. cit.

26 Graetz, loc. cit.

ambition and vanity²⁷--that he even hoped to become Pope.²⁸ Soon after his conversion he went to Paris where he attained a doctorate in Christian philosophy.²⁹ From there he went to Avignon where he became friendly with Cardinal Pedro de Luna who was to become anti-Pope Benedict XIII in 1394.³⁰

Paul was never friendly towards his former religion. Soon after his arrival at Avignon he sought to preach anti-Jewish sermons and was prevented from doing so only by the intervention of his friend, Cardinal de Luna.³¹ In time he was taken into the court of Don Henry III, King of Castile³²--in time becoming the keeper of the royal seal.³³ No sooner did he attain a position in that court than he tried to use his influence to have the king desist from appointing Jews to state offices.³⁴ Indeed, it would not be unreasonable to associate him with the inhuman execution of Don Meir Alguades, the former physician to King Henri III (and also the distributor of Al T'hi Ka-avotecha).³⁵

The remarkable fact about this converso is that he did, indeed, fulfill any ambitious wish he might have had in converting. His rise in the hierarchy of the Church was mercurial. He quickly became the Archdeacon of Trevino, then Bishop of Cartagena. Finally, he became

27 Kayserling, loc. cit.

28 Graetz, op. cit. p. 184.

29 Kayserling, loc. cit.

30 Baer, op. cit. vol. II p. 141.

31 Ibid. p. 155.

32 Graetz, loc. cit.

33 Kayserling, loc. cit.

34 Graetz, op. cit. p. 185.

35 Ibid. p. 195f.

the Archbishop of the city where he had been born as Solomon Halevi. He was succeeded in that post of Archbishop of Burgos, in his own lifetime by his son Alonso,³⁶ and died on August 29, 1435.³⁷

36 Kayserling, loc. cit.

37 Ibid.

A NOTE ON THE TEXT USED IN THIS TRANSLATION

In preparation for this thesis I have read the texts of Al T'hi
Ka-avotecha printed in:

Melo Chofnajim, Abraham Geiger, Berlin, 1840

Kobez Wikkuhim, Abraham Ginzburg, Breslau, 1844

Eben Boħan, P. Heilpern, Frankfort, 1846

My criterion in evaluating these texts was primarily clarity.

Sections of the Geiger and Ginzburg texts are patently unintelligible even with minute attention and painstaking translation. In almost all of these cases the Heilpern text did make sense. A secondary and closely related criterion was the correct rendition of Biblical texts. Often the first two versions garbled quotations so much that they were not recognizable as Biblical quotations and made little sense in any other context. In most of these cases Heilpern did present a correct rendition.

None of the editors indicate how they obtained their texts or what changes they made in the original to make it clearer. I, therefore, have no way of deciding which is more faithful to the first printed manuscript (Constantinople 1554). I cannot judge whether corruptions crept into Geiger's text (and the Ginsburg text which essentially reproduces Geiger with a few extra unintelligibilities) or Heilpern distorted the text in order to render it more understandable.

I have, therefore, taken a middle course. Wanting as much clarity in my translation as possible I have used the Heilpern text

as the core of my thesis. Whenever Geiger adds some nuance to the text which is missing in Heilpern, I have included it in the translation in brackets, i. e. []. Similarly, whenever I feel that the Geiger text is truer to the intent of Duran, I have included it in the body of the translation again in brackets, i. e. [], and have rendered the Heilpern translation in a footnote.

But I have also translated the Geiger text and have included it as an appendix to the thesis. It is, of course, less fully annotated than the Heilpern text. But Biblical and other textual citations have been made. I have taken the liberty of correcting Geiger in my translation where he has clearly misinterpreted an obviously Biblical quotation. Notes of clarification will have to be found in the main body of the paper in corresponding locations. In this way I have attempted to preserve both clarity and accuracy.

TRANSLATION OF THE LETTER

"To David when he feigned madness before Abimelech"³⁸ king of the world. "For the choirmaster on the 'death of his son'."³⁹ "Surely our diseases he did bear and our pains he did carry."⁴⁰ "Who said of his father and his mother I have not seen him."⁴¹ and of his elders I do not inquire about them. Maestro Astruc Francisco Dioscarne his Christian name.⁴² But before as a Jew I called him David Bonet Bonjorn, my brother.

38 Psalm 34:1. Used in the sense "when he changed his mind."

39 Psalm 9:1. A play on words using this otherwise untranslatable name to call attention to a major aspect of Christian doctrine.

40 Isaiah 53:4. Another evocation of Christology.

41 Deuteronomy 33:9.

42 There is no historical evidence that David Bonet Bonjorn changed his name upon conversion. Historical records do, however, reveal the existence of one Astruc Raimuch of Fraga, a physician, who, upon conversion, changed his name to Francisco Dioscarne. This (Astruc) Francisco Dioscarne wrote a conversionary tract and sent it to a friend. The friend, not wishing to offend the dominant religion wrote a very meek reply. Several more spirited replies were written subsequently (Graetz vol. 4, p. 182).

This inclusion of Dioscarne's name here, therefore, might result from a copiest's error in associating Duran's letter with one of the later replies. Or might, by this time, have become designative of a given genus of Hebrew letters.

I saw a "scroll of secrets",⁴³ a "flying scroll",⁴⁴ "revealing the secret"⁴⁵ of redemption.⁴⁶ "Its words is tried."⁴⁷ I read it with heavy head and weak lips. "Its ways are greatly elevated."⁴⁸ Deep secrets are engraved on its tablets. The depths of its darkness have not been made known to me. It was hard for me to see⁴⁹ [as the words of a sealed book.] I was "wearied by its words."⁵⁰ I labored on the "abundance of the collection"⁵¹ of its secrets. Its concept and purpose were lost on me. But in a general way it was understood [by me] from it⁵² that "the inheritance of your fathers is false."⁵³ Sure they pursued

43 A common rabbinic idiom Jastrow p. 729.

44 Zechariah 5:1

45 Proverbs 11:13. Here used in apposition to "he who is of a faithful spirit".

46 Regardless of his actual historical circumstances, this opening paragraphs leaves no room to doubt that Duran's polemic is written in response to some missive he had received. Reference to the secret of redemption would cause us to further deduce that the letter he received was, indeed, one urging him to 'give up the yoke of original sin' and enter the 'community of the saved'.

47 2 Samuel 22:31.

48 Isaiah 55:9.

49 Isaiah 21:2. It is there rendered "a grievous vision; and followed by the words "the treacherous dealer dealeth treacherously".

50 Like Malachi 2:17.

51 Isaiah 47:9.

52 Similarly, we can gather from what follows that the letter to which Duran is responding denegated the value of Jewish tradition.

53 Jeremiah 16:19.

[vanity]⁵⁴ in their many speculations. Their wisdom is hidden.
[Their learning is stupid.] Their hope is dried up. And their redemption is false. They sought to ascend to heaven, and they descended into the depths of sheol in their foolishness. "They have sinned at the cost of their lives."⁵⁵ In vain will they do whatever they attempt in their time and "they will bear their shame."⁵⁶ Woe unto them for their toil and their labor for they did not "make their remnant a god even a graven image thereof."⁵⁷ Therefore the first section of your letter confused me after the toil and trouble because your words came hidden in it, like the words in a sealed book. And it appears to me that the [holy] "spirit hovers over"⁵⁸ you in a dream--a night vision.⁵⁹ And wakening--that which will save you in the spirit of the messiah--has not given you a "heart to know"⁶⁰, only an "ear to hear".⁶⁰ And you were regretful at first of your un-good deeds. For human understanding had drawn you and caused you to dwell in its dark dwelling. You thought it a crown and a wreath. But it was the "cruel poison of serpents."⁶¹ It was hateful to faith from eternity and the cause of damage--the damage of

54 Heilpern uses *Sheva* - reason.

55 Numbers 17:3.

56 Ezekiel 39:26.

57 Isaiah 44:17. Duran implicitly means 'it is a shame that after all their efforts, they did not accept Jesus.' By so doing he equates such acceptance with the making of graven images.

58 Genesis 1:2.

59 Job 4:13. Such visions were ascribed to the inferior prophets of the gentile peoples in Genesis Rabbah 52:5 in commenting on Genesis 20:3.

60 Deuteronomy 29:3.

61 Deuteronomy 32:33.

enmity. He is a fool who says that understanding and religion are two luminaries.⁶² For understanding has no portion in religion and religion has no share in what it (understanding) derives from its syllogisms and its proofs. It knows not "the way to the dwelling of light"⁶³ "all darkness is laid up for its treasures".⁶⁴ And those who trust in it: "The wicked shall return to the nether-world".⁶⁵ (As for) "But the righteous shall live by his faith."⁶⁶, according to the way you and your new teacher wish to define "faith" it raises one upward. When I saw, my brother, your eager devotion and your deeds in the name of heaven. Do not be led astray after understanding and its falsehoods which will be a [distortion]⁶⁷ and a detour for you. I sought to bestir you in the paths of faith. Be strong in the light of the messiah and his honor which shines upon you giving you rest.

Be not like your fathers who believed in a single God and who totally rejected any plurality from Him.⁶⁸ Not by compounding into genus or species what is taught about Him or His true definition. Not by relationship nor by being added to in number. They went astray in

62 Here Duran makes explicit his main point--Christianity rests on Pauline faith: accepting what is taught with a "hearing ear". Judaism, on the other hand, rests on reason, on understanding. It requires a "heart to know".

63 Job 38:14.

64 Job 20:26.

65 Psalm 9:18.

66 Habakkuk 2:4. So fundamental is this axiom to the teaching of the Apostle Paul that he, himself, quotes it three times in his epistles (Romans 1:17, Galatians 3:11, Hebrews 10:38).

67 Heilpern has >JYJ-shaking.

68 Duran here will argue that the doctrine of the trinity is incompatible with, and inferior to, pure monotheism. He discusses this same theme in the second chapter of his Kelimath Hagoyim.

saying "Hear O Israel the Lord our God, the Lord is one." and they understood from "the Lord is one" a simple unity alone onto which there is no adding and from which there is no subtracting. What the mouth is unable to speak and the ear 'too "heavy" to hear.'⁶⁹ And you, be not thus. Believe Him to be one and three. And the three are one, bearing several in one of its genera. And the one is three. Not three combined, but the essences of the three are unified "back to back".⁷⁰

Be not like your fathers who believed that God is without change in any of the forms of change.⁷¹ They erred in saying "I the Lord do not change."⁷² They thought of Him as a pure and simple intellect and rejected corporeal form from Him, which causes clarity to be confounded for the weak of sight among the multitude. (Rather they sought) to draw them after philosophy with all its powerful strength.

And you be not thus. Believe in the son with whom the womb of a virgo intacta became impregnated in a way wondrous and unknown, ('way') as in "the way of a man with a maiden".⁷³ She had no difficulty with her delivery. She did not cry out in her travails as one with child.

69 Isaiah 59:1.

70 Genesis Rabbah 8:1.

71 Duran regards the incarnation as an essential change in the divine nature which is wholly incompatible with the definition of a perfect God. He raises this same question in the third chapter of Kelimat Hagoyim. Here he combines that problem with a discussion of virgin birth.

72 Malachi 3:6.

73 Proverbs 30:19. By quoting this verse, Duran demonstrates that *na'ar* can in no way be interpreted as meaning virgin.

She was not gripped by birth pangs and anguish like one giving birth to a first born. "It was contrary with her from other women."⁷⁴ for she was as she was at the beginning. This was already given as a sign to be grasped by one of the little in faith who lived six hundred years before this. He taught about this when he said "behold the maiden shall conceive and bear a son."⁷⁵ Look not to the saying which says "the interpenetration of bodies is impossible without breaking or destroying." Believe in him who donned flesh in one of his manifestations. His blood was poured out like water to atone for his people and be required. 'And the third god came' as he wished.⁷⁶ Give thanks to him who bore death to redeem you and save you. "Your sickness he bore and your pains he endured."⁷⁷ His wisdom did not decree any plan to deliver you, other than (sending) him.

Be not like your fathers who furrowed deep into the story of creation to find in it hidden things and secrets of wisdom, they made seven examinations:⁷⁸ Of Adam and Eve, the snake and the garment of skins,⁷⁹ in the matter of the garden of Eden, the tree of the knowledge of good and evil, and the rivers. They favored the literal interpretation of the Torah verses, and in a manner that harmonized with philosophy they reasoned logical deductions from it.

74 Ezekiel 16:34. "... in that thou didst solicit harlotry and wast not solicited."

75 Isaiah 7:14.

76 After I Chronicles 11:25. Involving a play on the word *sk*

77 Isaiah 53:4.

78 Referring to the seven chapters of Genesis Rabbah (15-21) devoted to a discussion of the events in Genesis 2:8-3:24.

79 Genesis 3:21.

And you be not thus.⁸⁰ Take the matter literally but do not reason logical deductions. Only add some spiritual punishment onto Adam's bitterness which the last of the apostles⁸¹ innovated, who turned him over to the hand of "Satan" who will cause him to dwell in his abomination and will gather him in his net. There is no raising up for his downfall, until the coming of his redeemer who by his death delivers him from the hand of the oppressor and removes his rod from him. This punishment which is not mentioned in the Biblical text will be stripped off (him). But the curses which are stated there to endure will endure, like the sprouting of the thorn and the thistle.⁸² Be convinced of this secret my brother for it will double your reward. For you will be completely faithful like him who made you upright, the missionary whose name⁸³ is the same as your teacher's.⁸³

Be not like your fathers who substantiated their faith with the compelling logic of the principles of speculation into logic, mathematics, natural science, and metaphysics. From these and the like they inferred conclusions. On the foundations of the palaces of reason they "built towers builded with turrets".⁸⁴ They delved deep

80 Duran regards the concept of original sin as wholly extraneous to the Biblical account of creation. It was fabricated independently of the Biblical account and superimposed upon it.

81 The apostle Paul.

82 Jesus, in Duran's estimation, has power only over the essentially superfluous curses superadded to the Biblical narrative by Christian doctrine. He has no authority over the original curses inherent in the original account.

83 Paul of Burgos.

84 Song of Songs 4:4.

by employing the means of logic to distinguish between the types of demonstrative analogies in their respective kinds and orders. They gave great honor to Aristotle and his eight books on the esteemed studies which disclosed their origins, revealing secrets to praise and to acknowledge. From the depths of the sea of mathematics and geometry they brought up pearls. On the table of astronomy they ate in their pleasure. On the heights of the mountains of natural science they put up markers. In metaphysics they comprehended hidden secrets. Gold and precious objects could not equal their value.

[And you be not thus, perish the thought. Do not believe that the conclusion is inferred from the premises by means of the syllogism which is the foundation of logic. It is said by and large that this will bring you to atonement by the law of faith. If you say that the father is God and God is the son, do not deduce thereby that the father is the son.⁸⁵]⁸⁶

Do not think in any case that the mathematical premise will be right wherein large and small are interchanged or where a number is multiple [and unitary (at the same time)]. But according to faith the

85 Heilpern version: "And you be not thus, perish the thought. Do not believe that the conclusion is also deduced from the premises by the proposition of the syllogism which is the foundation of the logical skill. God will refute them all as they teach. For this will bring you to atonement by the law of faith. For you say that God is the father and the father is the son. Should you deduce therefore that God is the son? "Say to the father wherefore begettest thou?" (Isaiah 45:10) "This is the way of them that are foolish" (psalm 49:14)."

86 "The Father is God, the son is God, and the Holy Spirit is God. Yet these are not three Gods but one God" (Athanasian Creed).

large body of the messiah becomes equal to a wafer as small as a man's hand.⁸⁷ And (if you say this) you could even (go so far as to) say that it is possible for the entire world to enter a grain of mustard seed. Or that the number of bodies of the messiah which are on the altar change into a hundred or a thousand or ten thousand. And they are not a collection of several. But the ten and the hundred and the thousand are all one.⁸⁸

And do not let the principles of natural science deceive you that every movement occurs in time and that it is impossible to conjoin rest and movement in a single subject.⁸⁹ But the body of the messiah which resides in heaven were it to reside there tranquil and at ease would descend from the heights of heaven and come to the altar with the completion of the special incantation which comes from the mouth of-- not the high--priest--any priest be he lowly or great, wise or foolish, righteous or wicked, (heaven) fearing or sinful. For the essential quality inheres in the statement spoken out of the mouth of the messiah⁹⁰

87 With this Duran takes up the problem of the eucharist and transubstantiation. Of all the elements of the Christian faith, Duran dwells on this one longest--1/5 of the letter--and in greatest detail. This same "mystery" is the subject of the sixth chapter of Kelimath Hagoyim.

88 Returning to the eucharist, Duran discusses the problem that is technically referred to as existentia corporis ad modum spiritus: the totality of Christ's presence in his entirety in the whole of the host and in each smallest part thereof.

89 Duran will here raise the problem of multilocatio--the simultaneous existence of Christ in heaven and on many altars on earth.

90 The priest is but the agent of the power--not the bearer of the power. The affective power inheres in the incantation itself.

[after] "eating flesh and drinking wine"⁹¹ with his prophets, seers, students, and apostles, "let us eat and drink for tomorrow we shall die."⁹² Be strong in this faith my brother for it will bring you to eternal life and thus will your God be with you for you will eat the bread of your God.⁹³ "In the morning you will divide booty, in the evening you will eat the prey."⁹⁴ Woe to your fathers who ate the "bread of toil".⁹⁵ "And their souls fainted within them. They were thirsty and hungry."⁹⁶ "But you, your soul you will deliver."⁹⁷ For you will eat and you will drink. Your messiah is in your midst.⁹⁸ You will praise God and sanctify the holy One of Israel. And He will choose you.

Do not believe in the impossibility of direct movement⁹⁹ from the heavenly spheres, or that if it were possible tearing and breaking would be impossible. For would not the messiah's body be constantly pained every day and every night in his ascending to heaven and descending in a direct manner, and riddled with "holes [and orifices]"¹⁰⁰ in his constant coming from the day of his ascent until now] this about one

91 Isaiah 22:13.

92 Ibid.

93 *pan de os* can here mean not "the bread (belonging to) your God; but in accordance with Church dogma, "the bread (composed of the flesh of) your God."

94 Genesis 49:27.

95 Psalm 127:2.

96 Psalm 107:5.

97 Ezekiel 3:19.

98 Literally "You will eat and drink your messiah in your midst." You will take in salvation through the eucharist.

99 Still dwelling on the problem of multilocatio, Duran wonders about the means of travel of the body of Christ from heaven to the various altars on earth. Such a trip could not be instantaneous. It would involve traversing vast amounts of space which would involve a very real danger.

100 Morning prayer. (Hertz Prayer Book. p. 10).

thousand three hundred and sixty¹⁰¹ years. until his whole body would be almost like a sieve. Or (perhaps) it was wounded and he healed it by scattering adhesive medicine on it or by his own will alone, or by an utterance. Choose for yourself and believe one of these which appears to you most removed from the rational, and there is no contradiction in this. For by this you will affirm the infinite powers of the messiah-- which is the root of faith and "this is the law."¹⁰²

Do not believe in the principles of metaphysics, that it is impossible that in one proposition both an affirmation and its negation can be "true and righteous together."¹⁰³ Or that it is impossible to change an essence into an accident or an accident into an essence,¹⁰⁴ that the existence of the essence is in its essence and the existence of an accident is in the essence which exists by its (own) essence. But the body of the messiah which sits in heaven does not move and that which is on the altar moves with all kinds of movement. And the two are one.

[This thereby proves (the existence) of one who moves and doesn't move.]

Similarly the essence of the wafer before the incantation of the priest is truly the essence of bread. And with the completion of the formula

101 Geiger text has "one thousand three hundred and ninety years."

The difference may be attributed to his version's placing the terminus ad quem at Jesus' birth rather than his death.

102 Numbers 6:13.

103 Psalm 19:10.

104 Duran raises the question of the fundamental essence of the bread and wine. How can essential breadness and wineness inhere in the same subject with essential Christness?

the essence is transformed into the accident or it vanishes altogether in matter and form.¹⁰⁵ And the accidents subsist by themselves not by their existence in the substance. And after the accidents return it is part and parcel of the limbs of the priest who ate them.¹⁰⁶ And this is not denied by any of the faithful.

Do not be led astray, my brother, by the axiom which states that the whole is greater than a part of it. But (believe that) the whole is equal to the part and the part to the whole. For the wafer while infinite is finite by virtue of its being divided. In each of its parts is found the body of the messiah.¹⁰⁷ So the part and the whole are one. The parable of a shattered mirror¹⁰⁸ and the poetic analogy should be excellent and suitable for the likes of you. Let it enlighten the eyes of your reason.

105 Duran raises the third of the major problems of the eucharist, accidentia sine subjecto: the continued existence of the eucharist species--the outward appearances of bread and wine--without the natural underlying substance. That is, the accidents of bread and wine remain but the essential substances of breadness and wineness have been replaced by the essential substances of the flesh and blood of Christ though without the accidents of those latter.

106 They have actually been ingested.

107 How can the body of Christ, which after all is the very substance of the wafer, be both infinite and finite? Duran is again raising, in slightly different form, the question of existentia corpus ad modum spiritus.

108 Duran refers to a parable which states that the same essential Christ is in each of the pieces of the wafer just as the same essential subject is reflected in each of the fragments of a broken mirror.

Do not let your senses be deceived so that you err in seeing (the wafers) and (the accidents) that remain in them.¹⁰⁹ Lest you think that the appearance which you see and the sound, [taste,] touch, and smell are accidents subsisting on the bread alone. But all of them subsist by their (own) essences not in the subject. And from the other side do not be deceived my brother by the premise of optical science which states that the sense of sight (only) errs in perception if the organs are not healthy, the sockets (not) proportional, and the pupils (not) adequate.¹¹⁰ For you will "see gods rising"¹¹¹ and descending. "Your eyes will not be sated with seeing."¹¹² And in general, my brother, do not, perish the thought, acknowledge the proposition which states that it is impossible for nature to exist an eternal duration, (or that) it is impossible to change it. For this would qualify God and his power over it. For to all the well known "impossibilities" in the law of reason and nature--and there are many like this, I do not know the number, --let your thoughts be faithful. May the powers of the messiah rule over everything near and far, possible and impossible. Believe in what concurs with his wondrous secret. Deny necessary causality, for its logical extension will be false

Be not like your fathers for whom the Torah of Moses was an inheritance, who sought to comprehend the spiritual world with what

109 Duran here amplifies his rendition of the problem accidentia sine subjecto.

110 In effect Duran asks, if all these wondrous changes are taking place why can't you see them? Why can't you see the body of Christ entering or leaving the bread and wine?

111 I Samuel 28:13.

112 Ecclesiastes 1:8.

was included in its entirety-theoretical and practical. They wore it as crowns on their heads. To them it was an occupation better than any other. They rejoiced over its 248 (positive) commandments as over any possession. They were very careful and did not sin in any of its 365 prohibitions. They regarded it as eternal, saying of it, "The secret things belong unto the Lord our God; but the things that are revealed belong to us and our children forever that we may do all the words of this Torah."¹¹³ The prophets all gave admonitions about it. The last of them in his last utterance admonished about the remembrance of its statutes and ordinances.¹¹⁴

And you be not thus. [Leave it behind lest you be disdained. When you beget sons do not bring them unto the covenant of Abraham. Do not concern yourself with the laws of "menstruation", "handmaiden", "gentile woman", or "prostitute" (the forbidden sexual unions).]¹¹⁵ Do not remember the Sabbath and festivals to keep them holy. On the day of the special fast of atonement "eat and drink"¹¹⁶ I am telling you you will not have to bring a guilt offering for yourself. Do not fear the eating of leaven on Passover. In regard to all the forbidden foods, prefer the

113 Deuteronomy 29:28.

114 Malachi 3:22 "Remember ye the law of Moses my servant which I commanded unto him in Horeb for all Israel even statutes and ordinances."

115 Heilpern version: "And you be not thus. When you beget sons "the increase of your seed...year by year" (Deuteronomy 14:22) for you will not concern yourself with the laws of "menstruation" "handmaiden", "gentile woman", or "prostitute" do not bring them into the covenant of Abraham. Leave this behind lest they be disdained by them."

116 Proverbs 23:7 "...the morsel which thou hast eaten shall thou vomit up."

power of the lenient position. Eat ...¹¹⁷ meat and cheese to satiety without restraint--moss grass and onion leaves. Give no thought to the "sinew of the thigh-vein, which is upon the hollow of the thigh"¹¹⁸ or the fat that is on the loins. Do not examine large or small animals or fowl for the signs [of impurity]. "Be not rebellious like that rebellious house. Open thy mouth and eat that which I give thee"¹¹⁹ pig, rabbit, hare, owl, and fish-owl. "To feed you I have commanded the ravens."¹²⁰ An animal not killed according to ritual law, a ripped animal, and a pierced animal shall not be strange to you. But what will you do about the apostles of the messiah who admonished all those firm in the faith of the messiah about a pierced animal?¹²¹ And thus you will find in the book they call "Acts of the Apostles."¹²² And I read in the Acts of the Apostles chapter 15 that they admonished all the faithful about it. And by and large I saw nothing in any of them which denies anything of the 613 (commandments). And they taught (the law) to the seed of Abraham who received upon themselves and upon their seed the Torah of Moses.¹²³ And they themselves, since they were of that seed, fulfilled

117 Original reading: "Eat fish and meat and cheese..."

118 Genesis 32:33.

119 Ezekiel 2:8.

120 I Kings 17:4. The implication here is that the ravens will serve not only as the messengers but as the repast itself.

121 Duran intends this to indicate that they taught about the more generalized category of Kashruth.

122 Acts 15:20.

123 In chapter four of Kelimath Hagoyim Duran states that he intends "to show that Jesus never thought of opposing the divine Torah, but wished to maintain it forever. And that even his disciples considered it eternal for the people which had been ordered to observe it." (Rendered in Baron p. 103).

the Torah exceedingly after the death of the messiah and after they were immersed¹²⁴ in his name. [And you will also find (this) in the book of Matthew.¹²⁵ Similarly,¹²⁶ Stephen said that the fathers were buried in a field which Abraham bought from Hamor the son of Shechem.¹²⁷ He also mentions that Jacob descended into Egypt with seventy-five souls.¹²⁸ And the messiah himself said that in the days of Ahab the dew and rain were with-held for three and a half years.¹²⁹ This proves their perfection and erudition in the holy books. Concerning these doubts and those like them, they are "laid up in store with me, sealed up in my treasuries."¹³⁰ I will seek after you, my brother and friend. As you and your new teacher will investigate, cause me to recognize your solution. For I know that the holy spirit speaks also with you and no strength is with-held from you. Give

124 Baptized.

125 Matthew 5:19-20.

126 Chapter ten of Kelimath Hagoyim is devoted "to analyzing the mistakes, errors, and wrong interpretations given by Jesus, his disciples, and later apostles concerning Biblical verses contrary to the word of the Living God." (Rendered in Baron p. 103.) He lists some of those errors here.

127 Acts 7:16, referring to the cave at Machpelah which according to Genesis 23, Abraham bought from Ephron--not from Hamor as Stephen has it.

128 Acts 7:14. Referring to Genesis 46:27, "all the souls of the house of Jacob that came into Egypt were three score and ten" rather than seventy-five.

129 Luke 4:25. In fact no exact length of time is given in the Old Testament. But I Kings 18:1 would lead us to assume that the drought lasted precisely three years, and not three and one half.

130 Deuteronomy 32:34.

thanks to the messiah who chose you.] 131

Be not like your fathers whom the Sadducees critized by saying "the bones of an ass are clean, and the bones of Johanan the High Priest are unclean."¹³² And you, be not thus. Go to the valley and take the bones of a man, not one (alone) but the many that were with you are all holy,¹³³ do not be afraid to "make spoons out of them"¹³⁴ or "consult a ghost or a familiar spirit or a necromancer."¹³⁵ Strange and wondrous things render the impure pure as in the days ~~as in the days~~ of your exodus from Egypt (when) signs and miracles appeared to you.

131 Heilpern version: "This will be found in the well-known book. And they also observed the law of the Nazirine as is mentioned there. And just as I and they and the messiah himself acknowledge its eternity. And you will also find (this) in the commentary to the fifth chapter of the gospel of Matthew. Concerning these doubts and those like them, they are "laid up in store with me, sealed up in my treasuries." (Deuteronomy 32:34) I will seek after you my brother and friend. As you and your new teacher will investigate cause me to recognize your solution. For I know that the spirit of the messiah departs from him to speak with you. You will also find in the well-known book of the history of the missionaries that the proto-martyr Stephen said that the fathers were buried in Shechem in a grave which Abraham bought "from the sons of Hamor at Shechem." (Acts 7:16) He also mentions that Jacob descended into Egypt with seventy-five souls (Acts 7:14). And the messiah himself said--thus you will find in the book of the gospel of Luke, chapter four--that in the days of Ahab all dew and rain were with-held for "three years and six months" (Luke 4:25). All this will teach of their perfection and erudition in the holy book. Give thanks to the messiah who chose you, no strength is with-held from you."

132 Mishna Yadaim 4:6.

133 Duran here juxtaposes Judaism's traditional abhorrence of contact with the dead to Catholicism's cult of relics. He mocks that aspect of the Catholic faith which encourages the veneration of the bodies or bones of saints. He compares this practice to the consulting of ghosts etc. which was expressly forbidden in the pentateuch.

134 Mishna Yadaim 4:6.

135 Deuteronomy 18:11


And their remnants numerous as barley corn you will honor with gold, and precious stones. Your mouth will kiss them with the kiss spoken of in the Torah,¹³⁶ with complete and excessive affection. "Thy God, whom thou servest continually He will deliver thee."¹³⁷

I have sought to awaken you to this, my brother. For I know that you are a lover of truth insofar as it is the truth. You recognize your definition as a mortal human being. The delights of reason have not enticed you and have not misled you by their vanities. You have not been taken by their perversions, (nor) grasped by their ropes. You are pure in the ways of the faith in the messiah. "In his light you will see light"¹³⁸ all you do will succeed. Do not worry about the contempt which cleaves to your soul. "Let them be as a snail which melteth and passeth away."¹³⁹ Only by the humiliation, the weakness, and the humiliation which is evidenced on your face will your enemies shame you when they say to you all the day, "baptized one" or "circumcized infidel".¹⁴⁰ It is enough that your soul will endure forever in a joy whose quality cannot be measured. For you will see the face of the king "and the queen"¹⁴¹ sitting by him."¹⁴²

136 Genesis Rabbah 70:11 "All kissing is indecent save in three cases: the kiss of high office, the kiss of reunion, and the kiss of parting."

137 Daniel 6:17.

138 Psalm 36:10.

139 Psalm 58:9. Omitting  as a copiest's error.

140 Duran points out that the coverso was subject to ridicule from Jews and Christians alike. The Jews considered such people to be traitors, while the Christians thought them inadequate and insincere in their new faith.

141 Duran makes passing speculation about the domestic arrangement on high and suggests a possible heavenly role for the Virgin Mary.

142 Nehemiah 2:6.

Praised be the messiah "who has the likes of you in his world."¹⁴³

You further wrote and exaggerated and aggrandized in telling of the exaltation of your teacher and his perfection, all his splendid glory, and the glorious esteem of his greatness. You made him Pope.¹⁴⁴ [But from your remarks I would not know whether Rome or Avignon would be the seat of his sanctuary.¹⁴⁵] You said he was created in the image of the messiah and his likeness. I also know as you do all the great things he has done, of his knowledge of the spheres--their orbits, the rotation of their axes and the revolution of their circumferences--which resolves many enigmas, and (facilitates) elevated propositions and scriptural exegeses, and (benefits) the other sciences. Give thanks to the messiah "who has imparted of his wisdom to them who fear him".¹⁴⁶ Not for nothing has the king given him presents from his treasury.¹⁴⁷ For he saw him as "a just man walking in his integrity"¹⁴⁸ before him. He did him the honor to visit him constantly at his palace, and out of the

143 Berakoth 58b. A minor variation of essentially the same prayer is found in Aboda Zara 20a "praised be He who has created such in His universe." There it is uttered upon seeing a beautiful gentile woman.

144 Graetz implies that Paul's motives for conversion were not a little related to his vanity and ambition. He speculates that Paul himself may have entertained such lofty aspirations. (History of the Jews vol. 4 p. 184.)

145 Duran lived and wrote during the period of the "great schism" (1378-1417) when both Rome and Avignon supported rival claimants to the throne of Saint Peter.

146 Berakoth 58a.

147 "On the recommendation of the Pope he (Paul) was overwhelmed with honors and favors by the King of Castile, Don Henry III." (Graetz vol. 4 P. 184). Indeed, so friendly did he become with the king that in 1406 he became the keeper of the royal seal. (Jewish Encyclopedia vol. 9 p. 562).

148 Proverbs 20:7.

love he felt for him to be with him constantly in his enclosure. I would not know whether Rome or Avignon would be the seat of his sanctuary.¹⁴⁹ It is the intention of the Pope and the entire church to give him a special suzerainty or to make him a cardinal like the upper echelons.¹⁵⁰ Therefore, my brother, be greatly happy. For in his honor, honor will come to you. And he will surely also make you a member of the priesthood or levitical rank.

You inform me, my brother, that by his great power and by the king's love for him he attained the great achievement which will make public his name so that women and children above nine years will not be allowed to leave the Synagogue to go here and there.¹⁵¹ I will also admit that he attained a great thing and he is fortunate to benefit the masses and to recompense good to the wicked. Certainly go and bring good tidings to those who "bore sons

149 See footnote 145.

150 Indeed Paul did rise quickly in the hierarchy of the Church and in time became Bishop of Burgos.

151 The reference is obviously to the practice of forced sermons where Jews were compelled to go to their Synagogues and listen to conversionary sermons. But there is no evidence whatever that Paul himself engaged in these activities. Vincent Ferer lived at the same time as Paul of Burgos and was well-known for his activity in this area. (Graetz vol. 4 p. 202) It is possible that Duran attributed Ferer's activities to Paul. With regard to the specific mention of women and children (the Geiger manuscript gives the age as "under fifteen") it is interesting to note that such references figure in the official proclamations of the age. In 1263 James I of Aragon, at the instigation of Pablo Christiani decreed that monks were to be allowed to enter Synagogues and force "young and old, men and women to convene at the will of these friars in any chosen place and at any time to listen to their words diligently and silently." (Baron vol. 9 p. 72) On May 11, 1415 anti-Pope Benedict XIII decreed "We order that in all cities, towns and localities where, in the Bishop's opinion, sufficiently large numbers of Jews reside, there should be delivered three public sermons annually. We expressly order that all Jews of both sexes from the age of twelve who are able to appear in these cities and towns must unconditionally attend." (Baron, vol. 9, p. 74)

and daughters"¹⁵² and to noble women. We learned from a rumor that in Avignon (he) sought to speak wickedness about the Jews. But the Cardinal of Pamplona and other deputies ordered not to devise evil against the children of Israel.¹⁵³ And the assembly gave him several hundred florins in secret. And not for nothing did the great rabbi, the exalted one in Israel [Hasdai Crescas] of great name, flee from offering (him) weighty (arguments).¹⁵⁴ "where the upright might reason with him."¹⁵⁵

Concerning that which you wrote me admonishing me with "vain chastisements"¹⁵⁶ that those who serve me have confused my thoughts, I am not amazed. Because you know from of old that my devotion is acceptable and my deeds prove it true. I am upright with my God with all my heart, with all my soul for all eternity. "God is my strength, and my stronghold"¹⁵⁷ my song, "the stability of thy times and a hoard of salvation".¹⁵⁸ And in our righteous God--not in the messiah who is called by His name--is my trust and hope. From of old I cling to this faith. Nothing has changed with me in the slightest, and my mind has not changed. [And He who I believe in now is He whom I have believed in these twenty years.] May Jesus the messiah whom you have chosen--he and no other--let his countenance shine upon you and be gracious unto you.

152 Jeremiah 29:6.

153 "Paul...wished to preach anti-Jewish sermons at Avignon but was prevented by the Cardinal of Pamplona (Pedro de Luna, later anti-Pope Benedict XIII) and two other leading dignitaries of the church." (Baer, vol II, p. 155)

154 "(Paul) tried to force his former friend Rabbi Hasdai Crescas to engage in religious disputation with him; but for the moment the influence of the Jewish philosopher at court sufficed to set at nought the designs of the new Christian theologian." (Baer vol. II p. 142)

155 Job 23:7.

156 Jeremiah 10:8.

157 Jeremiah 16:19.

158 Isaiah 33:6.

Only one thing I ask you. I beg that from now on you do not employ in your signature the name of your father, the revered sage of blessed memory. Into your council let his soul not come, let his glory not be united with your memory.¹⁵⁹ For were he alive, he would have preferred the absence of a son like you to his existence. And even now his soul mourns where he is in his final rest. Behold your eyes see that the mouth which speaks to you is one who loves you forever,¹⁶⁰ who desires that you be righteous. And to what profit? That thou makest thy way blameless.¹⁶¹ "And it shall be if you hearken. . . to the Lord your God."¹⁶² He will make peace for you and bless you. And every place where I cause my name to be mentioned¹⁶³ I will take you as a brother and a beloved son. My brother if he is still alive David Bonet Bonjorn. Or if he is not still alive Astruc Francisco Dioscarne.¹⁶⁴

159 After Genesis 49:6.

160 After Genesis 45:12.

161 After Job 22:3.

162 Deuteronomy 11:13.

163 Exodus 20:20.

164 There is no historical evidence that David Bonet Bonjorn changed his name upon conversion. See footnote 42.

APPENDIX A

TRANSLATION OF THE GEIGER TEXT

"To David when he feigned madness before Abimelech" (Psalm 34:1), King of the world. "For the choirmaster on the 'death of his son'" (Psalm 9:1). "Surely our diseases he did bear and our pains he carried." (Isaiah 53:4). Who says of his father and mother I did not see them (Deuteronomy 33:9) and of his elders I did not inquire of them. I called him my brother Magister Bonet Bonjorn, the Christian. Before, in Israel, his name was David Bonet Bonjorn.

"I saw a scroll flying" (Zechariah 5:1) revealing the secret of redemption. "Its word is tried" (2 Samuel 22:31). Deep secrets, on its tablets. "Its ways are greatly elevated." (Isaiah 55:9). The depths of its darkness have not been made known to me. I read the scroll of secrets with heavy head and weak lips. I was "wearied by its words" (Malachi 2:17). They caused me to labor on the unsearchable essence of its secrets. "It was hard for me to see (Isaiah 21:2) as the words of a sealed book. Its concept and purpose were lost on me. But in a general way it was understood by me from it that "The inheritance of your fathers is false." (Jeremiah 16:19). Surely they pursued vanity in their many speculations. Their wisdom is concealed. Their learning is stupid. Their hope is dried up. And their redemption is a vanity. They sought to ascend to heaven and they descended into the depths of sheol in their foolishness. "They have sinned at the cost of their lives." (Numbers 17:3). In vain did they do whatever attempted in their time and "they will bear their shame." (Ezekiel 39:26). Woe to them for their toil and their labor for they have made their remnant into a fragment. Therefore the first section of your letter confused me after the toil and the trouble because your words came hidden in it and it appears to me that the holy "spirit hovers over" (Genesis 1:2) you in a "night vision" (Job 4:13) and this awakening will save you. Praised

be the messiah who gave you a "heart to know" (Deuteronomy 29:3) and a "hearing ear" (Deuteronomy 29:3). For human understanding would not draw you to cause him to dwell in his dwelling--a dark dwelling. Nor were you regretful at first of your good deeds. It (reason) was thought loathsome and "the cruel poison of serpents" (Deuteronomy 32:33). It was hateful to faith forever and caused the damage of enmity to righteousness. Anyone who says that understanding and religion are two luminaries is confused. For understanding has no (portion) in it with the conclusion it derives from syllogisms and its proofs. "It knows not the way to the dwelling of light." (Job 38:14). "All darkness is laid up for its treasures." (Job 20:26). Faith lifts upward and the evil ones who renounce it return to Sheol. Thus it is written "and the righteous shall live by his faith," (Habakkuk 2:4). If "faith" is defined in the Hebrew language as you and your teacher wish. When I saw, my brother, your eager devotion and your deeds in the name of heaven. For faith is a girdle for your loins. Do not be led astray after understanding and its falsehoods which will be a distortion and a detour for you. I sought to bestir you in the paths of faith. Be strong in the light of the messiah and his honor which shines upon you taking you to rest.

Be not like your fathers who believed in a single, simple, God alone and who totally rejected any plurality from Him--who went astray with the saying "Hear O Israel (the Lord our God, the Lord is One.)"

And they understood from "one" what is taught about it in the true meaning of its definition. Not one in (the sense of) amalgamation or species or genus or relationships or being added to in number. And you be not thus-- believe Him to be one and three. And the three are one and the one is three bearing several in its unitary essence. Not three conjoined but essentially unified "back to back" (Genesis Rabbah 8:1). What the mouth is unable to speak and the "ear too heavy to hear" (Isaiah 59:1) do not add (on to it) or subtract (from it).

Be not like your fathers who believed without change in any of the forms of change. And they erred in saying "I the Lord do not change." (Malachi 3:6). For they rejected from Him any corporeality with all its powerful strength. In their speculation they gave Him a pure and simple understanding to draw them after speculation in their great multitude and tumult. They became angry with those who stretch the Torah who cause clarity to be confounded for the weak of sight among the multitude. And you be not thus. Do not reject from Him corporeality and bodiliness, perish the thought. Believe in him who donned flesh in one of his manifestations "and the third god came as he wished" (Chronicles 11:25). His blood was poured out like water to atone for his people and be requited. Give thanks for Him who bore death to redeem you and save you. "Your sickness he bore and your pains (he endured)". (Isaiah 53:4). His wisdom did not decree any plan other than to deliver you. Believe in him who became incarnated in the womb of a "maiden"-- which (of course)

indicates in the Hebrew language a virgo intacta, as in "the way of a man with a 'maiden'" (Proverbs 30:19) which is associated with those things mentioned above (it) which do not make a path and they are difficult to describe--similarly for a virginal woman to make love with a man is difficult (to imagine). The sign has already been given about this to one of the littlest in faith who preceded this by five hundred years. She had no difficulty with her delivery. She did not cry out in her travails as one with child. She was not gripped by birth pangs and anguish like one giving birth to a first born. For "it was contrary for her from other women" (Ezekiel 16:34) for she was as she was at the beginning. Look not to the saying which says "the interpenetration of bodies is impossible".

Be not like your fathers who furrowed deep into the story of creation to tell from it hidden things and word(s) of wisdom. In a manner which harmonized with philosophy they reasoned logical deductions from it. In the matter of the garden of Eden, the rivers, and the tree of the knowledge of good and evil they made seven examinations. And (similarly) of Adam and Eve and the garment of skins. And you be not thus. Take the matter at its simplest. Only add on to Adam some spiritual punishment, from the downfall of which there is no raising up. Turn him over to the hand of "Satan" who will cause him to dwell in his abomination and he will gather him in his net, until the coming of the redeemer who by his death delivers him from the hand of the oppressor

and removes his rod from him. This punishment, which is not mentioned in the Biblical text, is stripped off (him). But the curses which are stated to endure will endure. So too the sprouting of the thorn and the thistle. Be convinced of this secret, my brother, of the spiritual punishment which was promulgated to him by the head of the missionaries whose name is the same as your teacher's. For this will double your reward. For you will be completely faithful like he who made you upright.

Be not like your fathers who substantiated their faith with the compelling logic of the principles of speculation into natural science, metaphysics, logic, and mathematics. From these and the like they inferred conclusions. And on the foundations of such compelling logic they built "towers builded with turrets." (Song of Songs 4:4). They deepened its pit by employing the means of logic. To distinguish between the types of demonstrative analogies in their respective kinds they gave a large portion to (Aristotle and) his eight books on the esteemed studies, which disclosed their origins--speaking matters and revealing secrets to praise and to acknowledge. From the depths of the sea of mathematics and geometry they brought up pearls. On the table of astronomy they ate in their pleasure. On the heights of the mount of natural science, they put up markers. In metaphysics they comprehended hidden secrets. Gold and precious objects could not equal their value. "This is the way of them that are foolish" (Psalm 49:14) my brother.

And you be not thus, perish the thought. Do not believe that the conclusion is yielded from the premise by means of the syllogism which is the foundation of logic. It is said by and large that this will bring you to atonement by the law of faith. If you say that the father is God and God is the son do not deduce thereby that the father is the son. Do not think in any case that the mathematical premise will be right wherein large and small are interchanged or where a number is simultaneously multiple and unitary. But before faith the large body of the messiah becomes equal to a wafer as small as a man's hand. It is even possible to the believer that the entire world can enter a grain of mustard seed. Or that the number of bodies of the messiah which are quantified change into thousands and hundreds. And they are not a collection of several. But the ten and the hundred and the thousand are all one. And do not let the principles of natural science deceive you that every movement occurs in time and that it is impossible to conjoin rest and movement in a single subject. But the body of the messiah which resides in heaven descends from the heights of heaven and comes to the altar while he is still sitting there tranquil and at ease. And this with the completion of the special incantation from the mouth of the not-high priest--any priest be he lowly or great, wise or foolish, righteous or evil, (heaven) fearing or sinful. For the essential quality inheres in the statement transmitted out of the mouth of the messiah after eating and drinking with his prophets, seers,

students, and apostles. Be strong in this faith for it will bring you to eternal life and thus will God be with you for you will have eaten the bread of your God. "In the morning you will divide booty, in the evening you will eat the prey." (Genesis 49:27).

Woe to your fathers who ate "the bread of toil" (Psalm 127:2) "and their souls fainted within them--they were thirsty and hungry." (Psalm 107:5). But you, my brother, your soul will prosper. You will eat and be satisfied. Your messiah is in your midst. You will praise God and sanctify the holy one of Israel in your midst. Do not believe in the impossibility of direct movement the heavenly spheres or that if it were possible tearing and breaking would be impossible. For would not the messiah's body be constantly pained in his ascending and descending directly and riddled with "holes and orifices" (morning prayer) in his constant coming so that from the day of his ascent to heaven until now--about one thousand three hundred and ninety years--his whole body would be almost like a sieve. Or it was wounded and then healed by scattering adhesive medicine on it or by his own will or by an utterance. And it is possible for you to say more about the entry of the bodies and there is no discrepancy in this. So choose for yourself one of these which appears to you most removed from the rational. If you will affirm this about the powers of the messiah: that he is infinite--which is the root of faith; then "this is the law." (Numbers 6:13). Do not believe

in the principles of metaphysics. For it is impossible that both an affirmation and its negation can be right. Or that it is impossible to make an accident the essence and the essence an accident. And also the proposition that says that the existence of an essence is in its essence and the existence of an accident is in that substance whose essence exists by its essence. But the body of the messiah who sits in heaven does not move and that which is on the altar moves and it is possible that (it moves) in all the classes of movement. And the two are one. This thereby will prove (the existence) of one who moves and doesn't move. The essence of the wafer before the incantation of the priest is truly the essence of bread. And with the completion of the formula the essence is transformed into an accident. Or it vanishes completely in its form and matter. And the accidents subsist (by themselves) not by their existence in substance. And after those accidents return, it is part and parcel of the priest who ate it. And this is not denied by any of the faithful. And from the other side, my brother, do not be led astray by the premise of optical science which states that the sense of sight does not err in its perceptions as long as the organs are adequate and the pupils healthy. For "you will see gods rising" (I Samuel 28:13). "Your eyes will not be sated with seeing" (Ecclesiastes 1:8). Do not let your senses be deceived so that you err in seeing. And they (those accidents) lest you think that the appearance which you see and sound, taste, touch, and smell are accidents joined together on the bread alone. For all of them subsist

in their (own) essences not in the subject. And you will not be deceived by the axiom which says that the whole is greater than the part. And you be not thus. But the whole is equal to the part and the part to the whole. For the wafer while infinite is finite by virtue of its being divided. So the part is in the whole and the whole is one. The parable from a shattered mirror will light the eyes of your reason, for the poetic analogy should be excellent and suitable for the likes of you.

In general, my brother, do not, perish the thought, acknowledge the proposition which states that it is impossible for nature to exist an eternal duration. It is impossible to change it or any of the well-known impossibilities in the law of reason and nature. And there are many like this, I do not know the number. Let your thoughts be faithful. May the powers of the messiah rule over everything--near and far, possible and impossible. Deny whatever does not concur with his wondrous secret. Believe in the affirmative for its opposite will be false.

Be not like your fathers for whom the Torah of Moses was an inheritance, who sought to comprehend the spiritual world with whatever was included in it--theoretical and practical. They wore it as crowns for their heads. To them it was an occupation better than any other. They rejoiced over its 248 (positive) commandments as over any possession. They were very careful and did not sin in any of its 365 prohibitions. They regarded it as eternal saying of it, "the secret things belong to the

Lord our God (but the things that are revealed belong to us and to our children forever.") (Deuteronomy 29:28). The prophets all always gave admonitions about it. The last of them in speaking his last utterance admonished about its remembrance and its statutes and ordinances. And you be not thus. Leave it behind lest you be disdained. When you beget sons do not bring them into the covenant of Abraham. Do not be troubled by the laws of "menstruation", "handmaiden", "gentile woman", or "prostitute". Do not remember the sabbath and festivals to keep them holy. On the special fast day "eat and drink " (Proverbs 23:7). I am saying to you you will not have to bring a guilt offering for yourself. Do not fear the eating of leaven on Passover. In regard to all the forbidden foods, prefer the power of the more lenient position. Eat meat and cheese without restraint. Give no thought to a utensil (being) milchic. Open your mouth and eat pig, rabbit, and hare. Do not examine fish or fowl for the signs of impurity--or locusts. Eat the owl and the fish-owl to satiety. "I have commanded the ravens to feed you." (I Kings 17:4). An animal not killed according to ritual law, a ripped animal and a pierced animal shall not be strange to you. But what will you do about the missionaries of the messiah (since) all of them admonished all the faithful about it (dietary law) and thus you will find in the book they call ("Acts of the) Apostles". I read in the Acts of the

Apostles that they told all the firm believers in the messiah about a pierced animal. (Acts 15:20). And by and large I saw nothing in any of them that negated anything of the 613 (commandments) and that they taught the law to the seed of Abraham who received upon themselves and upon their seed the Torah of Moses. And they themselves, since they were of that seed, fulfilled the Torah exceedingly after the death of the messiah and after they were baptized in his name. And you will also find (this) in the book of Matthew. (Matthew 5:19-20). Similarly Stephen said that the fathers were buried in a field which Abraham bought from Hamor the son of Shechem. (Acts 7:16). He also mentions that Jacob descended into Egypt with seventy-five souls. (Acts 7:14). And the messiah himself said that in the days of Ahab the dew and the rain were with-held for three and a half years. (Luke 4:25). This proves their perfection and erudition in the holy books. Concerning these doubts and those like them they are "laid up in store with me--sealed in my treasury" (Deuteronomy 32:34). I will seek after you my brother and friend. As you and your new teacher will investigate, cause me to recognize your solution. For I know that the holy spirit speaks also to you, and no strength is with-held from you. Give thanks to the messiah who chose you.

Be not like your fathers who accepted upon themselves righteous

laws in that they said that "the bones of an ass are pure and the bones of a high priest are unclean." (Mishna Yadaim 4:6). Go to the valley and take the bones of a man. Do not be afraid to "make spoons out of them" (Mishna Yadaim 4:6) as in the days of your exodus from Egypt (when) signs and miracles and strange and wondrous things appeared to you. One (alone) does not render unclean things pure. For the multitude that was with you was all holy, similarly with the prophets. Seek of the dead and their remnant numerous as barley grain you will honor with gold and silver and precious stone. Your mouth will be kissed by the kiss spoken in great love and excessive affection. "Serve thou the Lord constantly" (Daniel 6:17).

I have sought to awaken you to this my brother. For I know you are a lover of truth insofar as it is truth. You recognize your definition as a mortal human being. The delights of earth have not enticed you and have not misled you by their vanities. You have not been taken by their perversions (nor) grasped by their violences. You are pure in the ways of your faith--faith in the messiah by whose "light you will see light" (psalm 36:10). All you will do will succeed. Do not worry about the humiliation, the weakness, and the contempt which cleave to the soul, or the humiliation which is on your face. Your enemies shame you. "Let them be as a snail which melteth and passeth away" (Psalm 58:9). When they say to you all the day "immerse" "repent" or "circumcise".

It is enough that your soul will endure in a joy whose quality cannot be measured. For you will see the face of the king and "his queen sitting by him." (Nehemiah 2:6) in his enclosure. You further wrote and exaggerated and aggrandized in telling of the exaltation of your teacher and his perfection, all his glory, and the glorious esteem of his greatness. You said he was created in the image of God and His likeless. And you made him (Pope). But from your remarks I would not know whether Rome or Avignon would be the seat of his sanctuary. I also know, as do you, all the great things he has done. Of his knowledge of the spheres--their orbits; the rotation of their axes and the revolution of their circumferences--which resolves many enigmas and (facilitates) elevated propositions and scriptural exegesis and (benefits) the other sciences. Give thanks to the messiah "who has the likes of him in his world" (Berakoth 58b). Not for nothing has our lord the king given him presents from his treasury. For he saw him as a "just man walking in his integrity" (Proverbs 20:7) before him. Not for nothing did the great rabbi, the exalted one in Israel, Hasdai Crescas, choose (to refrain) from the telling of his powers. And his upright name reproved him. He did him the honor to visit him at his palace and to be with him constantly out of the love he felt for him. You inform me, my brother, that by his great power and by the love of the lord our king he attained the great achievement which will make public his name so that women and children under fifteen years will not go

out to go here and there. I will also admit that he attained a great thing and he is fortunate that he merits to benefit the masses and to recompense good to the wicked. Certainly go and bring the good tidings to those who "bore sons and daughters" (Jeremiah 29:6) and to noble women. We learned from a rumor that in Avignon (he) sought to speak wickedness about the Jews. But his highness the cardinal of Pamplona and other princes in the council ordered not to devise evil against the children of Israel. And the assembly gave him many florins in secret. The intention of the Pope and of his entire Church is to give him a special suzerainty or to make him a cardinal like the upper echelons. Therefore my brother be greatly happy. For in his honor, honor will come to you. And he will surely also make you a member of the priesthood or levitical rank.

Concerning what you wrote me, you admonished me and chastised me a "vain chastisement" (Jeremiah 10:8) (saying) those who serve me have confused my thoughts. I am amazed. Because you know from of old that my devotion is acceptable and my deeds prove (me) true. I am upright with my God with all my heart, with all my soul for all eternity. His righteous messiah who is called by His name is my trust and my hope. He is my shelter, my refuge and my song, "the stability of my times and a hoard of salvation" (Isaiah 33:6). From of old I cling to this faith. Nothing has changed with me in the slightest and my mind has

not changed. And He whom I believe in now is He whom I have believed in these twenty years. Only one thing I ask of you. I beg you that from now on you do not employ in your signature the name of the revered sage your father. Into your council let his soul not come. Let his glory not be united with your memory. (Genesis 49:6). For were he alive, he would have preferred the absence of a son like you to his existence. And even now his soul mourns in his final rest.

May Jesus the messiah let his countenance shine upon you-- he and no other--and may he give you peace and bless you. The words of one who loves you, (who wants) that you perfect your path. "And it shall be if you hearken to the voice the voice of the Lord your God" (Deuteronomy 11:13). I will make peace for you and I will bless you in every place where you will remember my name. I will take you as a brother and a beloved son.

Your brother Ephodi.

APPENDIX B

THE HEILPERN TEXT

אגרת.

אוגרת מכל אבקת רוכל מקיטרת מור ולבונה,
נודע בשערים בעלה גדול שמו אצל כל פנה,
עטרת הפארת צדקה וקר רוח איש הבונה,
דון מאיר אלגואדיש — רב רבנן ראש אמנה,
מנחה היא שלוחה לאביניון לעשו אהיו למנה. —

מגלת (י) ספרים ראיהי מגלה (עפה, מגלה) סוד הגאולה —
אמרתה (י) צרופה! קראויה ככבוד ראש ובשפה רפה (י); גברו
מאור (י) דרכיה, סודות (י) עמוקים חקיקים על לוחותיה, לא נודעו
לי עקבות העלמויות, היה לי הוות (י) קשה-הנעתני (י) בדבריה,
הלאהני בעצמת חברת (י) סודותיה, ומעוט המושג אצלי מחועלתיה —
והמוכן ממנה על דרך כלל, הוא כי שקר נחלו אבותיך הלויך הלכו
אחרי השכל, ברכ חקירהם, נסחרה ביניהם, נכובה הוהלחם ושקר
חשועם, חשבו לעלות השמים וירדו מעמקי שאול בסכלותם,
החטאים האלה בנפשותם, לשקר עשו כל מה שהשחרלו בו באולתם
ונשאו כלמהם, אוי להם על עמלם ויגיעם כי לא עשו לא לפסלו (י)
שאריתם — עד כה השנתי בחלק הראשון מכרכך, אחר העמל
והטורח, כי באו בו דבריך נעלמים וכדברי הספר החתום, וכמדומה

כי רוח מרחפת על פניך בחלום חזיון לילה, והקני (י) — היא השתק
ברוח המשיח — אשר לא נתן לך לב לדעה, רק אוון שומעת, ועל
מעשיך לא טובים עשית מעיקרא חרטה, כי משך אותך (י) השכל
האנושי להשכיך במשכנו משכן עלמה, — חשבתו עמרה (י) לראש
זור, והוא ראש פהנים אכור, שונא הוא מעולם לאמונה וגורם
להזיקה (י) נזק צרורות, וסכל! מי שאמר השכל והדה שני (י) מאורות,
אין לשכל חלק באמונה ולא לאמונה נחלה במה שיוליד בהקשיו
ובמופתיו, לא ידע הדרך ושכן אור כל חושך טמון לצפוניו, והכוחים
בו ישובו רשעים לשאולה, וצדיק באמונהו יהיה כפי גדר האמונה
שאחה ומלמדך החדש חושקים הוא תעולה למעלה! — וכי ראיתי
אחי! כינהך רצויה ומעשיך לשם שמים, לא חפנה אחר השכל
וכוביו להיותו נענה ונעקש דרכים, באחי להעירך על דרכי האמונה
אשר באור המשיח וכבודו הוורח עליך נתן לך למנה.
אל תהי כאבותיך, אשר האמינו בה' אחד ושללו ממנו הרבוי (י)
לגמרי, לא בהרכבה מסוג ומין מה שיוורה עליו באמתת (י). גדרו, או
ביחס לא (י) מוסף במספרו; וטעו במאמר שמע ישראל ה' אהינו ה'

אחד, והבינו מה' אחד אחרות⁽¹⁾ פשוטה לבר עליה אין להוסיף וממנה אין לגרוע, מה שאין הפה יכול לדבר⁽²⁾ וככדה האון משמע ואתה לא כן, האמינהו אחד ושלשה, והשלשה אחד נושא לכמה באחד⁽³⁾ מכוננו - והאחד שלשה לא שלוש צרופי יך עצמי שלשה מתאחדים⁽⁴⁾ גב לגב. -

אל חתי כאבותיך, אשר האמינו באלהים בלתי משהנה באחד מאופני השני, ומעו באמרו אני ה' לא שנית, וחשבוהו שכל פשוט ונקי, ושרלו ממנו⁽⁵⁾ הארי הגשמיות אשר הושמו מסך להלושי הראוה⁽⁶⁾ ככל המונס, להמשכם אתרי הפילוסופיא ככל מאמצי כח עיונם. -

ואתה לא כן, האמן בנן שנחעבר כפנן הכחולה ההמימה, בדרך נפלא לא ידעויו⁽⁷⁾ כמו דרך גבר בעלמה - לא קשחה בלדחה ולא זעקה בהבליה כמו חרה, ולא אחווה צירים וצרה כמבכירה, ויהי כה הפך מן⁽⁸⁾ הנשים והתי ככראשונה, כבר נרנן זה לאות לאחו אחד מקטני אמה, שחיה קודם זה כשש מאות⁽⁹⁾ שנה, וורה על זה אמרו הנה העלמה חרה, לא הביט למאמר האומר היות כניסת גשם בגשם נמנע מבלי שבירה וסתירה - האמן בו שנחלבש בשר באחד מהאריו ונשפך כמים דמו לכפר על עמו ונרצה, ואל השלשה, בא כאשר רצה - חן תודה אליו אשר סבל המור להושיעך ולהצילך, חריוך הוא נשא ומכאובך, לא גורה הכמחו, אויפן אחר לישועתך וזלחו. - אל חתי כאבותיך, אשר העמיקו בסיפורו של מעשה בראשית ולמצוא בו תעלומות וסתרי חכמות עשו שבע חקירות, ובאדם וחיה נחשו וכחנות העורות, ובדבר גן עדן עץ הדעת טוב ורע והנהרות, נשאו פנים⁽¹⁰⁾ לפשוטי פסוקי התורה ובאופן שיסכים עם הפילוסופיא סברו בו סברות.

ואתה לא כן, קח הענין כפשוטו ולא תסבור בו סברות, רק שחויביך לאדם על מריו עונשנפשו אשר חדשו אחריו⁽¹¹⁾ השלוחים, והוא המוסרו ביד השטן יגורוהו בחרטו יאספהו במכמרתו, אין תקומה למפלחו, עד בו גואלו אשר במיתחו פדהו מיד צר והסיר מעליו שבטו - עונש זה שלא נזכר בחורה - נערר, והקללות האמורות שם על עמרם תעמודנה עם צמיחת קוץ ודרדר! - חזוק כוח היסוד אחי! וזה יכפיל שברך, כי רחיה מאמין כאשר הישירך, השליח ששמו⁽¹²⁾ בשם רבך -

אל חתי כאבותיך, אשר הביאם הכרח יסודות השכל להורות בהחלוצת עיונות⁽¹³⁾ הניוניות למודיות טבעיות אלהיות, ומרהנה למיניהם הולידו תולדות, ועל יסודם בהיכלי השכל בנו מגדלים

לרזלפיות; העמיקו בהשגת דרכי ההגיון להבריל בין מיני ההקש
המופתי וזולחו וסדריו, וחלקו כבוד לאריסטו^(י) גם לשמנה ספריו;
ובלמודיות^(י) היקרות שמו כל מעינם וגלו סודות, להלל ולהודות
וממעמקי ים הכמת המספר^(י) והחשבורת העלו פנינים, ובשולחן חכמת
^(י) החכונה הגלגלית אכלו למעדנים, ובמרום הרי החכמה^(י) המכעית
הציבו ציונים, ובאלהיות השיגו סהרים צפונים, לא יערכם זרוב
ומגרנים —

ואתה לא כן, הלילה לך! לא חאמין שיוליד גם המין הראשון מן
ההמונה הראשונה מהמונות ההקש אשר היא^(י) יסוד מלאכת ההגיון,
ואיה ישובון כלם כפי הנאם, כי זה יביאך לכפירה^(י) בחק האמונה;
וכי האמר הא הוא האב, והאב הוא הבן, ויוליד אם כן! הא הוא^(י)
הבן! — אמור לאב מה חוליד! זה דרכם כסל למו. —

לא החשוב שהצדקנה על כל פנים ההחללות הלמודיות אשר
הגדול והקטן מהחלפים ושהמספר קבוצ אחדים; כי לפי האמונה
גוף המשיח הגדול שיה לעונה קטנה ככף איש, ואפשר שהאמר
עוד בהכנס הגשמים שיכנס העולם כנגד חרדל - וכן מספר גשמי
המשיח אשר בבמה מחלפות, למאות אלפים ולרבבות, אינם
קבוצ אחדים אבל העשרה והמאה והאלף אחד - -
ואל יטעון ההחללות הטבעיות, שכל תנועה בזמן ושאי אפשר
להקבץ נחד התנועה והמנוחה בנושא אחד; כי גשם המשיח היושב
בשמים עם היווה יושב שם שקט ושאנן יורד משמי שמי קדם ובא
אל הבמה עם השלם המאמר ההוא הנבחר היוצא מפי הכהן ליה
גדול אבל איזה כהן שיהיה כקטן כגדול כהם כסכל כצדיק כרשע
כירא כהוטא כי הכנולה דבקה במאמר הנאמר מפי המשיח אכול
בשר⁴⁰ ושהות יין עם נביאיו וחכמיו תלמידיו ושלוחיו אכול ושהו כי
מחר⁴¹ נמות - ההוק בואת האמונה אחי! כי היא תביאך לחיי עד
וכן יהיה אלהיך עמך כי תאכל את לחם אלהיך בערב החלק שלך
ובבקר תאכל עד - אחי! להם לאבותיך, אוכלי לחם העצבים, נפשם
בהם התעטף צמאים גם רעבים, ואהה את נפשך הצלת כי האכר
וכי השחה מושיעך בקרבך, האל תעריץ ותקדיש קדוש ישראל ויבחרך.
ואל האמן בהמנע מהגרם השמימי התנועה הישרה, ולזה המנע
אצלו הקריעה והשבירה, - כי המיד כל היום וכל הלילה לא יחשה
גשם המשיח בעלותו שמים ורדתו דרך ישראל, ויעשהו נקבים נקבים
זה סביב אלף שלש מאות⁴² וששים שנה עד שנעשה כל גופו
ככברה, או ימחץ וירפאהו בסמים מדביקים או ברצונו לכד או
באמירה, בחר לך והאמן אתה מאלה אשר תראה יותר חולקת על

המושכלות ואין בזה סתירה, כי עם זה הורה כיכולת המשיח בכלתו הכלית אשר הוא שורש האמונה וזאת התורה —

אל האמן בהתחלות הכמה האלהיות, שאי אפשר שיהיה במשפט אחד חיוב ושליטה אמת צדקי יהדיו, ושנמנע ההפך העצם מקרה, והמקרה עצם, שמציאות העצם בעצמו ומציאות המקרה בעצם הנמצא בעצמוהו; כי גוף המשיח היושב בשמים לא יתנועע, ואשר בבמדה מהנועע בכל כיני התנועה ושניהם אחד! — וכן עצם העונה לפני מאמר הכהן הוא עצם הלחם כאמת, ועם השלמת המאמר נהפך העצם למקרה או נעדר העדר גמור בחומר ובצורה, ויעמדו המקרים בעצמם לא במציאות נושאם, ואחר ישובו המקרים עצם והלק איברי הכהן האיכל אותם; וזה לא יכפור אחד מן⁽³³⁾ המאמינים.

לא הטעה אחי! בהתחלת המושכל ראשון שהכל גדול ויורר מן החלק ממנו — אבל הכל שיה להלק, והחלק לכל, כי העונה הכלית בעלת תכלית בכת החלוקה, בכל חלק מהחלק נמצא גוף המשיח, והחלק והכל אחד — והמשל מהמראה הנשברת וההקש⁽³⁴⁾ השירי הנבחר וראוי לשכמות, יאיר עיני הכמתך. —

ואל יטעך הישך, ותשנה כרואה ובנשאים⁽³⁵⁾ מהם, ותחשיב המראה אשר הראה והקיל והבישיט והרית מקרים עימדים על הלחם לבדו — כי כולם עימדים בעצמם לא בנושא — ומצד השני, לא הטעה אחי! בהתחלת הכמת המכטים האומרת שתוש הראית⁽³⁶⁾ יטעה במושגי אם לא יהיה הכלי בריא והמרחק נערך⁽³⁷⁾ והאמצעי נאות — כי אלהים הראה — עולים ויורדים, לא השבע עיך לראות —

ובכלל אהיו! לא תודרה חלילה לך! בהקדמה האומרת כי לנמנע.
מבע"ק קיים עומד או אפשר לו להשתנות; ומפני זה לא יהא
השם ביכולת עליו – כי לכל הנמנעות בהק השכל והטבעים הנזכרות,
וכאלה רבות לא אדע ספורות, הדינה מהשבויהך אמונות – השלט
יכולת המשיה על כל דבר, קרוב או רחוק אפשר או נמנע – האמן!
מה שבא על כוהנו מופת, הכוב במחויב! כי שוא תהיה תמורה –
אל רהי כאבותיך אשר היה להם למורשה, רגורתו שר
משה, השבו להשיג העולם הרוהני כמה שתכללהו משלמות העיון
והמעשה, ענדה לראשם עמדות, טוב להם כהרה מכל הסחורות
ששי כעל כל הין על רמיה מצותיה, נודתו מאוד ולא הטאו בדבר
משם"ה אהרותיה, השבו נצהיית לאמרה הנכחות לה' אלהינו
והנגות לנו ולבנינו עד עולם לעשות את כל דברי התורה
הוא" ובהזכיר כל הנביאים עליה, והאחרון בדבר האחרון דהזכיר
בזכירה הוקייה ומשפטיה. –
ואה לא"ק) כן! כי תוליד בנים תבואת זרעך שנה בשנה – כי
לא תחוש לנדה שפה גויה זונה – לא הכניסם כבדיתו של אברהם

הנח לה! פן תהיו לבז עמכם. לא תזכור את יום השבת והמועדות
לקדשם, וביום צום כפיר דמיוהר "אכול ושהה" – האמר לך –
ולא הביא עלך אשם – מאכילת המץ בפסח לא דירא, ולכלל.
המאכלות האכורות עדיף כהא דהחורא, אכול לשבעה דגים כשר.
וגבינה באפיקורן את החציר ואת הכצלים, ולא תהיש לגיד הגישה.
אשר על כף דיורך וההלב אשר על הככלים; לא תבדוק כסימני
בהמה היה ועוף ואל תהי מרי כביה המרי פצה פך ואכול ארץ.
אשר אני נוהן לך את החור ואת השפן ואת הארנבת את דוכסי
ואת השלך, ואת העורבים צייתי לכלכלך, נבלה וטרפה והתחורה.
לא תהוה לך דיוהר אכל! – מה תעשה? ושלוחי המשיח כלם
חזוירו כד המתויקים באמינה המשיח על התחורה, וכן תמצא בספר
הנקרא להם אקמים אפוסטולורום ואני קראתיו תולדות השלוחים
פרק מ"ז שהחזירו עליה כל המאמינים – ובכלל לא אראה באהר

מהם שהכניב²²) דבר בתריג ושהחירו לזרעו של אברהם אשר קבלו על נפשם ועל זרעם תורתו של משה, והם בעצמם לפי שדיו מן הזרע הזה קיימו התורה מאוד אחר מיתת המשיח ואחר שצבלו בשמו, כי כן המצא בספר הזכור, וגם תורת הנזיר שמו כנוכר שם. ומה לי? ולהם! והמשיח בעצמו הורה כנצחיותו, ואת זה המצא בשער ההמשה מספר המבשר מאטיבי בבאור -- ונתת על הבקשות האלה וכיוצא בהם הבמוכרת עמדי ההתומות

באצרותיו, אשהרץ אחי וראש! שתהקרו אהה ומלמדך ההדש, והעמידוני על התרתכם, כי ידעתי רוח המשיח עבר מאותו לדבר אותכם. כן המצא בספר תולדות השלוהים הנזכר שהפרוטי מארטר אישטיבאן אמר שנקברו האבות בשכם בקבר אשר קנה אברהם מאת בני הנזיר בשכם, והזכיר גם כן שיעקב ירד למצרים בשבעים והמשה נפש, והמשיח עצמו אמר -- כן המצא בספר המבשר לוקאס פ' רביעי -- שבימי אהאב נעצר טל ומטר שלש שנים ששה חדשים יורה כל זה על שלימותם ובקאותם בספרי הקודש. רון תורה למשיח שבחר²³) בכס, וכל רו לא אנס לכם. אל תהי כאבורתי, שקבלו מהם²⁴) הצדוקים באמרם עצמות המור מהורים ועצמות ויהן כהן גדול טמאים. ואחרי לא כן! צא אל הבקעה וקח לך עצמות אדם, לא אחד אבל רבים אשר יתקן כל קדושים לא תירא מעשות איהם תרודים,²⁵) גם שאול באוב יידעוני ודרוש אל המהים, ודברים זרים נפלאים יתן מהיר²⁶) מטמא כימי צאהך מארץ מצרים יראוך האותות והמופתים; ושאריתם עצם כשעורה הבדר בזהב ואבן יקרה, ועל פיך ישק כל נשיקה האמורה²⁷) בתורה, באהבה גמורה ובחברה יהירה, אהך הוא ישוביך²⁸) דוא אנת פלח ליה בתדירא. יאח זה ראיתי להעירך אהי! כי ידעתיך איהם האמת²⁹) מצד שהוא אמר, מכיר אתה גדרך חי מדבר מת, לא הסיתוך מחמדי השכל לא הפיתוך כהבלים, לא נלכדת בשחיתותם נאחזות כהבלים. חמים אהה בדרכי אמונת המשיח, באורו הראה אור וכל אשר תעשה הצליח. לא הדאג על הביון³⁰) הדבק בנפש וחמס

ההלך לפניו כמו שכלול, רק על הכניעה והדלות והשפלות אשר
על פניו והרפוף צוריון באמרם אליך כה היום -טבור! כופר
מהול! - רב לך! בהשאר נפשך לעד כהענוג לא השוער איכותו
כי רצאה פני המלך והשגל יושבת אצלו אחו עמו, הן תורה
למשיח שנכה לך" בעולמו. - -

ואשר עוד כהבה והפלה והגדלה בספיר מעלה מלמדך ושלימותו,
ואת כל כבוד עשרו ויקר השארה גדולהו, ועשית אורו אפיפיו
במאמר ואמרה שנברא בצלם המשיח ודמותו. גם אני ידעתי כמין
את כל הגדולות אשר עשה וההכנות הגלגליות בוולר יציאת מרכו
והחלפות קטבם וגלגלי ההקף אשר מצא, וכמה העדומות חכמות
והקדמות רמות, דרש רשומות בשערי החכמות. הן תורה למשיח
שחלק מחכמתו ליריאו. לא להגם נתן לו המלך מהנות מבית
גמיו, כי אותו ראה צדיק מההלך בחומו לפניו. כבוד עשה לא
לבקר חמיד בהיכלו ומאהבה אשר אהבו להיות חמיד אצלו במהיצהו,
לא ידעתי אם ילך דומה - או באבוניו ההיה מנוהתי. דעת
האפיפיו וכל הכנסיה, לתת לו אחת מיוהדת הגמוניה, או לעשות
אוחו קארדינאל כמיוהדים בבני עליה, לכן אחי! הגיל בשמחה כי
בכבודו יהיה לך כבוד ועשה יעשה גם הוא לך בתי כהונה ולויה. -
ואשר הודעתני אחי! כי בכחו הגדול ובאהבת המלך אותו
השיג השנה גדולה שיעשה כרוו שלא הרשינה הנשים, ובנים מהושע
שנים נצחת" מבהכני ללכת אנה ואנה. גם אני אידך שדבר
גדלו השיג, ואשריו שוכה לזכות את הרבים ולגמול מציבות לחייבים.
אמנם! - צא ובשר לאשר הולידו בנים ובנות, ולנשים העדינות,
למדנו מפי השמועה ששם באבוניו חשב לדבר על היהודים תועה,
וצוה מהקארדינאל באנפלונא ומשרים אחרים שלא יחרוש על בני

וישראל רעה, ונחנו לו הקהל כמה מאות פרחים בצנעא. ולא לחנם
ברה הרב הגדול המיוחד בישראל גדול שמו, מהגיש העצומותיו
אליו ושם⁽⁹⁾ — ישר נוכח עמו. —

ועל אשר כרבה לי והוכחתי ויכרתני מוכר⁽¹⁰⁾ הבלים, כי אצלו
עויתו מהשכתי המורגלים, לא אפלא! — כי ידעת מאז כינתי רצויה
ומעשי עליה מיכיהם! המים אני עם ה' אלהי בכל רבביו ובכל⁽¹¹⁾
נשתי לנצח נצחים; ה' עוזי ומעוזי וזרתי אמונה עתי וחוכן ישעיהי ובה'
צדקני⁽¹²⁾ — לא בבישה הנקרא בשמו — כבטחי והקורני; וגם כיון
אני דבק בואת האמונה, לא נהדש אצלי מרע כלל ומעמי לא שנה.
ישו הכשיה שבו בחרתי הוא ולא אחר יאר פניו אליך ויחנך. —

אחת שאלתי מאתך איהא אבקש אשר מבאן ואילך לא העל-
על כשר שם החכם הנכבד אביך ויל בחימתך, בכורך אל הבא נפשו
ואל ההד כנידו בזכירך, כי אם היתה בחיים חיינו, ביחר הורה
העדר בן כמך על מצויאותו, וגם עתה נפשו עליו האכל באשר הוא
שם בבית מנהגו — — והנה עיניך הרואות כי פי המדבר⁽¹³⁾ אליך,

איהבך מעולם חזק כי חזק, ומה בצע? כי תתם דרכיך! - והיה
אם שמוע השמע בקול ה', יעשה לך שלום ויברכך, ובכל מקום אשר

אזכיר את שמי לאח ולבן יקר יאקדך. אחי הווא! דעודנו הי
דוד בוניט באנגוידיש! ולא אם עודנו הי, אשטרוק פראנצישקו
דיוכקורנים. -

שעל הכתב,

לדוד בשנתו את טעמו לפני אבימלך מלכו של עולם, למנצח
על מות לבן חליו הווא נשא וכמאוביו הווא סבלם, האוטר ראביו
ולאכו לא ראתיו וזקיניו לא שאלם. מאיטרי אשטרוק פראנצישקו
דיוכקורנים שמו המשוה אליו קראתי לפנים בישראל דוד בוניט
באנגוידיש אחי. -

APPENDIX C

THE GEIGER TEXT

אגרת אל תהי כאבותיך לאפודי.

לדוד בסגורו את טעמו לפני אבימלך מלכו של עולם למנצה על
מורח לכן הוליו הווא נשא ומכאוביו הוא סובלם האומר
לאביו לא ראתיו וזקניו לא שאלם אליו קראתי אחי
מאישברי בוניט בן נורן המשיחי שמו ל'פנים
בישראל דוד בוניט בן נורן .

ר'איתי מגלה מגלה סוד הנאולה עפה סודות עמוקים, על
לוחותיה חקוקים, אמרה צרופה גבהו מאוך דרכיה,
ולא נודעו לי עקבות העלומיה, מגלת סהרים קראתיה בנוכר ראש
ובשפה רפה הונעתני בדבריה, הלאיתני בעצמה חקרת סודותיה,
היתה לי הוות כולה כדברי הספר החתום ומעט הוא המושג אצלי
בהעלומיה, והמובן טמנה אצלי על דרך כלל הוא כי שקר נחלו
אבותיך הלק הלכו אחרי ההבל ברוכ חקירהם, נסתרה ביניהם
נסתרה חכמהם נמוכה תוהלהם ושקר תשועהם, חשבו לעלות שמים
וירדו בעמקי שאול בסכלותם, ההטאים האלה בנפשותם, לשקר
עשו כל מה שהשתדלו בו כאילתם ונשאו בו כלבתם, אוי להם
על עמלם ויגיעם כי עשו לפסל שאריהם. עד כאן השנתי בחלק
האחר ממכתבך אחר העמל והטורח כי באו בו דברך נעלמים
וכדוסה לי כי רוח הקדש מרהפת על פניך בהיוון לילה והקיצות היא
השיחך. ברוך המשיח שנחן לך לב לדעת ואוון שומעה, לא משך
אותך השכל האנושי להשכינו במשכנו משכן עלטה, ולא על מעשיך
טובים עשית מעיקרא חרטה, השבחו לזר, ראש פתנים אכזר, שונא
הוא מעולם לאמונה ונורם לצדקה נוק צרורות, נסכל מי שאמר

השכל והדח שני מאורח, אין לשכל בדבר טמא שוליד מהקשיו
ומפחיו לא ידע הדרך ישכון אור כל חשך טאון לצפוניו, האמונה
היא העולה למעלה, והנזופרים בה ישובו רשעים לשאולה, ולחזר
אמר וצדיק באמונתו יהיה, אם נדר האמונה בלשון עברית כמו
כאהה ופולמך חושקים. וכי ראיתי אחי כוונתך רצויה ובעשך
לשום שמים, והאמונה לך אזור הלצים, לא התפתה אחרי השכל
וכוביו והנהך נעה ונעקש דרכים, ראיתי אחי להעריך על דרכי
האמונה, אשר באור הכשית וכבודו הזרח עליך לקחת לך לטנה.

אל חתי כאבותך אשר האמינו באל האחדות הפשוטה לכר
ושללו ממנו הרבוי לגמרי וטעו במאמר שמע ישראל
והבינו מהאחד כה שירה עליו באמת נדרו, לא אחד בהרכבה
ובכין ובסוג וכיהם או נוסף במספרו, ואהה לא כן האמינו אהר
ושלטה והשלטה אהר והאחד שלטה נושא וכמה באחדיו מסוגיו
לא שלש רצופי אך עצמי מהאחד כמו לנו מה שאין הפה יכולה
לדבר וכבדה האון בשמיע, אין לרופיף ואין לנרוע.

אל חתי כאבותך אשר האמינוהו בלתי משתנה באהר מאופני
השנוי וטעו באמרו אני ה' לא שניתי שללו ממנו הנשמות
בכל מאמצי כח בעיונם נהגוהו שכל פשוט נקי להמשכם אחרי
העין ברוך המונם ושאוונם, נהנו פנים לפשטי ההורה אשר הושכו
סכך לחלושי הראורז בכל המונם, ואהה לא כן לא השלול ממנו
הנשמות והנפשות הלילה לך והאמן בו שנחלבש בשר באהר כחארי
אל השלטה בא כאשר רצה, ונשפך כמים דמו לכפר על עמו
וערצה, חן הורה אליו אשר סבל הכות לרשעים ולהצילך הליך
הוא נשא וכנאובך לא גורה הכמתו אופן אהר להושיעך גורלו.
האמן בו שנחבשר בבטן העלמה המורה בלשון עברית בהולה
המיכה כמו דרך נבר בעלמה שהוא סמוך עם הנזופרים למעלה
כאנים עושים שביל ורבים קשים לצייר וכן האשה הבחולה להשוק
נר הוא קשה וכבר נתן על זה אות לאהר בקטני אמנה שהיה
קום זה כה' שגור ולא קשתה בלדתה לא צעקה בהבליה כמו

היה לא אחוזה שירים וצורה כמכירה וירי כה הפך מן הגשים
והיה כראשונה לא חביט למאמר האומר היות כניסת הגשמים נכונה.
אל התי כאבותך אשר העמיקו בסיפורו של מעשה בראשית
להגיד בו העלויות ודבר הכמות באופן שיסכים עם הפלוסופיא
מברו בו ספרות, ובדבר גן עדן והנהרות ועץ הדעת טוב ורע עשו
שבע הקירות, ובאדם וחוה ובהנחת העורות, ואחיה לא כן קח הענין
כפשוטו רק שתוסף לאדם עונש נפשי על מה הוא אין תקומה
למפלו, והוא המסרו ביד השטן יגורו בהרמו ויאספיהו בכמרתו,
עד בוא גואלו אשר במיתתו פדהו מיד צר והסיר מעליו שבטו
ועונש זה שלא נזכר בכתוב נעדר, והקללות האמורות שם על עמדם
תעמודנה וצמיחת קין ורדף, החוק בזה הסוד אחי כהעונש הנפשי
אשר הדשו ראש השלוחים ששמו כשם רבך כי זה יכפל שכר
כי חדי כאמין שלם כאשר הישיר.

אל התי כאבותך אשר הביאום יסודות הכרח השכל להורות
בהתחלות העיוניות טבעיות ואלהיות הניגונים למוריות,
ומהנה למיניהם הולידו הולדות על יסודות בהכרח השכל בנו מגדלים
לתלפיות, העמיקו שהתו בהשגת דרכי ההגיון וסדריו, ולהכדיל בין
מיני ההקש המופתי וזולתו נהנו חלק גדול לשמונה ספריו,
ובלימודיות הקירות שמו כל מעינים ודברו דברים וגלו סודות, להלל
ולחורות, מכעמקי ים בהכמת המספר וההשכרות העלו פנינים,
ובשלחן הכמת ההכונה הגלגלית אכלו מעדנים, ובכרום הר ההכמה
הטבעית הציבו ציונים, ובאלהיות השיגו סתרים צפונים, לא יערכם
זהב ומדננים, וזה דרכם כסל למו אחי, ואחיה לא כן הלילה לך
לא תאמין שיליד המין הראשון מחמונה ראשונה מן ההקש אשר
הוא יסוד הכמת ההגיון כפי הנאמר על הכל כי מזה יבוא לכפירה
בחוק האמונה, אם תאמר האב הוא האל והאל הוא הבן לא
יוליד אם כן האב דווא הבן לא תחשוב שתצדקנה על כל פנים
ההתחלות למוריות, אשר הגדול והקטן מתחלפים ושהמספר קבוע
אחרים או אחרות, כי לפני האמונה גוף המשיח הגדול שזה
ונשוא לעונה קמנה ככה איש ואם איפשר הוא האמן שיכנס העולם

כולו בנתיב הרדל והחן ושם נשמי המשיח אשר בכמות
מהחלפות לאלפים ומאות אינו קבץ אחדים אבל העשרה והביאה
והאלף אחד, לא המעקף ההתחלפות המכניזם, שכל הננועה בזמן
ושאי אפשר להתקבץ יחד המנוחה וההננועה בנושא אחד כי נשם
המשיח היושב בשמים ירד משמי קדם ובא אל הבמה עם היוצא
ישב שם שקט ושאנן וזה עם המאמר השלם ההוא הנבחר היוצא
מפי הכרין לא גדול אבל אי זה כהן שיהיה כגדול כקטן כחכם
כסכל כצדיק כרשע כירא כחוטא כי הסגולה דבקה במאמר הנמסר
בפי המשיח אחרי אכלו ואחרי שהו עם נביאיו והכמיו תלמידיו
ושלוחיו. החוק בואת האמונה כי הוא הביאך לחיי ער, וכן יהיה
אלהים עמך כי האכל את להם אלהיך בבקר החלק שלל ולערב
האכל ער.

אוי להם לאכוחך אוכלי לחם העצבים, נפשם בהם רחצטף
צמאים גם רעבים, ואהה אחי נפשך הצלת האכל והשבע
משיעך בקרבך את האל רזעריך והקדיש קדוש ישראל בקרבך
ואל האמן בהמנע מהגם השמימי הננועה הישרה, ולורה המנע
אצלו ג' הקריעה והשבירה, כי רמזי כל היום לא יחשה נשם
המשיח בעלותו ורדהו דרך ישרה, יעשהו נקבים נקבים חלולים
בוא יבוא ער שמיום עלוחו שמים ועד עתה סביב סביב אלף וש'ץ
שנה קרוב הוא שנעשה כל גופו ככברה, יא ימחץ וירפא בזולת
סמים מדביקים או ברצונו יא באמירה, ואפשר שתאמר עוד
בהננס הנשמים ואין בזה סתירה. בחר לך אחד מאלה אשר
תראה יותר חולקת עם המושכל ועם זה רחודה כיכולת המשיח
שהוא בכ"ה אשר הוא שרש האמונה וזאת ההוררה, אל תאמן
בהתחלת החכמה האלהית שא"א שיצדקו יחד החיוב והשלילה
ושא"א יתהפך המקרה עצם והעצם מקרה וגם בהקדמה האומרת
שמיצאות העצם בעצמותו ומציאות המקרה בנושא הנמצא העצם
בעצמותו כי גוף המשיח היושב בשמים לא יתנועע ואשר בכמה
מתנועע ואיפשר בכל סוגי התנועה ושניהם אחד א"כ יצדק באהר
שיחנתעע ושלא יתנועע וכן עצם העונה לפני מאמר דהכהן הוא

עצם הלחם באמת ועם השלמתו המאמר נהפך העצם למקרה או נעדר העצם העדר נמור בצורתו וחמרו ויעמדו המקרים לא כמציאותם בנושא ואחר ישוכו המקרים ההם עצם וחלק אבר דהנה האוכל אותה וזה לא יכפור בו אחד מהמאמינים, ומצד אחר אחי לא הטעה בהתחלת הכמת המכטים האומרת שחוש הראות לא יטעה במושגו כל זמן שיהיה הכלי נאור והאמצעי בריא כי אלהים תראה עולים לא רשבע עינך לראות ולא יטעך חושך ותשנה בראות והנשאים בהם ושהחשוב המראה אשר הראהו והקול והטעם והמשוש והריח מקרים עומדים על הלחם לבדו כי כולם עומדים בעצמותם לא בנושא, לא תפנה בפלילור המושכל הראשון האומר שהכל גדול מן החלק ואהה לא כן אבל הכל שזה לחלק והחלק לכל כי העונה הב"כ"ר בכח הלוקה בכל חלק מחלקיה נמצא גוף המשיח והחלק בכל והכל אחר והמשל מהמראה הנשברת יאיר עיני שכלך כי הלימוד השירי נבחר וראוי לשכמורדן ובכלל אחי לא תורה הלילה בהקדמה האומרת לנמנע טבע קיים עומד וא"א לו דההנהגות ולכל הנמנעות בחוק השכל והטבע הנזכרות וכהנה רבות לא אדע ספורות דהיינה מחשבותיך אמונות השלט יכולת המשיח על כל דבר קרוב או רחוק נמנע או אפשר הכוב מר שלא בא על סודרו מופרז, והאמן במחויב כי הוא רזהיר תמורדו.

אל רזהיר כאבותיך אשר היה להם למורשה תורתו של משה שחשבו להשיג עולם הרוחני במה שרצו כללם מהעיון והמעשה ענדה עמדות טוב להם סתרה מכל סתורה ששו כעל כל הון על ר"מ"ח מצוריה, נהרו מאוד ולא חטאו בדבר מש"ס"ה אזהרותיה, חשבה נצחית לאומרה הנסתרות ל"ה אלהינו ובהנהיג רמיר כל הנביאים עליה ואחרונם בדבור המאמר האחרון דהנהיג על זכירתה ומשפטיה וחוקיה, וארה לא כן הנח לה פן רזהיר לבדו, כי תוליד בנים לא רכניסם בכריתו של אברהם ולא החוש לנשג'ז, לא חזקו את יום השבת והמועדות לקדשם, וביום הצום המיוחד אכול ושתה אומר לך ולא תביא עליך אשם,

מאכלה המץ לא תירא, ולכל המאכלות אסורות עריך כח הורא
דהתירא, אכול בשר וגבינא באפיקורן ולא ההוש לכף הולברא,
פתח פיך ואכול הויר ושפן וארנבת, לא תבדוק בסימני דגים ועופות
טמאים וחגבים, אכול לשבעה את הבוס והשלך לכלכלך צוירתי
את העורבים, נבלה ומרפה והנהורה לא ההייתה לזרה, אבל מה
רעשה ושלוחי המשיח כולם הזהירו עליה כל המאמינים וכן המצא
בספר הנקרא אפושטולורום ואנכי קראהו תולדות השלוחים ואמר
כל המחויקים באמונת המשיח על הנהירה ובכלל לא אראה דבר
באחד מהם שהרסו דבר מהיר'ג ושהתירוהו על זרעו של אברהם
אשר קבלו על נפשם ועל זרעם ראותו של משה והם בעצמם לפי
שהיו מזרע ההוא קיימו התורה מאוד אחר מיתר המשיח ואהרי
שטבלו בשמו וכן חמצא בספר מטיאו. וכן אישטיקאן (6) אמר
שנקברו האבות בשדה אשר קנה אברהם טאת המור בן שכם והוזכר
ל'כ שיעקב ירד למצרים בע' וחמש נפש והמשיח בעצמו אמר
שבימי אחאב נעצר שלש שנים ומהצה טל ומטר יורה על שם
שליטתם ובקיאותם בספרי הקדש, והנה כל הספיקות האלה וכיוצא
בהם הכמוסות עמדי החומות באוצרותי אשרהיך אחי וראש שהחקרו
אחה ומלמדך ההדש שהעמידוני על התירם כי ידעתי כי רה'ק
דבר גם אתכם, וכל רו לא. אנס לכם, רהנו ראודה ל'כשיה
שבהר בכם.

אל תהי כאבותיך שקבלו עליהם חקים צדיקים באחרם עצמות
חמור טהורים ועצמות כה'ג טמאים, צא לבקעה וקח לך
עצמות אדם לא תירא לעשות אותם הרודים כימי צאתך במצרים
יראוך האוהות והמופתים ודברים ורים ונפלאים, הן טהור מטיא
לא אחד רבים אשר אתך כל קדושים וגם בנביאים, דרוש אל
המהים ושאריתם עצם כשעורה, הככר בורב ובכסף ובאבן יקרה,
ועל פיך ישק כל נשיקה האטורה, זבאהבה גדולה והבה ירדירה,
אנת פלח ליה בתדירא.

את זה ראיתי להעיד אחי כי ידעתך אוהב האמת מצד שהוא
אמת מכיר אתה גורך חי מדבר מת לא הסיתך מחמדי
הכל ויפהך בהבליהם, לא נלכדת בשחיתותם נאחזת בהבליהם,
הבים אתה בדרכי אמונתך אמונת המשיח, כאורו הראה אור
וכל אשר העשה הפליח, ולא תדאג על הבניעה והדלור והביוון
הדבק בנפש והשפלות אשר על פניך יחרפק צודדיך ותבסס תהלך לפנייהם
כמו שכלול, באמנם אליך כל היום טבול כופר או מהול, רב
לך בהסאר נפשך בתענוג לא ישוער איכותו, כי הראה פני המלך
והסגל יוסבת אצלו במחיצתו, ואשר עוד כהבת והפלת והגדלת
בספור מעלה מלמדך ושלימותו, ואת כל כבודו ואת יקר הפארת
גדולתו, ואמרת שנברא בצלם אלהים וכדמותו, ועשית אותו במאמר
לא אדע אם ילך לרומא או באבינון תהיה מנוחתו, גם אני ידעתי
כמוך את כל הגדולות אשר עשה והתבונות הגלגליות בוולח יציאת
מרכו והתהלכות קטבם וגלגל ההקף אשר כצא כמה תעלומות
הקדמות רבות, דרש רשומות, בשאר ההכמות, רתן תורה לביטוי
שכחה לו בעולמו, לא לחנם אדונינו המלך נתן לו מתנות בבית גניו
כי אותו ראוי צדיק לפניו מתהלך בחומו, לא לחנם כהר המיוחד
לישראל רבי הסדאי קרשקש מהגיד העצומות ושם ישר נוכח
עמו, כבוד עשה לו לבקר בהיכלו ולהיות המיד אצלו מאהבה
אשר אהבו. ואשר הודעתני אחי כי בכוחו גדול ובאהבת אדונינו
המלך השיג דההשגה גדולה שנעשה כרוז שם שלא הצאנה הנשים
והבנים פחוחים בט"ו שנה ללכת אנה ואנדה, גם אני אורך שדבר
גדול השיג ואשריו שוכה את הרבים ולנמול טובות לחייבים, אמנם
צא ובטר לאשר הולידו בנים ובנות, ולנשים העדינות. מפי
הסמועה לכדנו ששם באבינון השב לדבר על היהודים הוערה,
וצוה מן האדון הקדינאלי די פאנפלונא ומשרים אחרים בצנעה,
שלא יהרוש על בני ישראל רעה, ונהנו לו הקהל הרבה פרהים.
דעת האפיפיור וכל כנסיא שלו להתר לו אחת מיוהרת הגמוניא או
לעשות אותו קרדינאלי כמיוהרים שבבני עלייה, לכן אחי הגדל
שמהה כי בכבודו כבוד יהיה לך ועשה יעשה לך גם הווי בתי

מהנהגה ולוידה. ועל אשר נהבט אלי והוכחתי ויכרתי מוסר
הבלים כי משרתי המורגלים אצלי עוהו מחשבתו אפלא כי ידעת
מאז כוונתי רצויה ומעשי מוכיחים, רומים אני עם אלהי בכל לבבי
ובכל נפשי נצח נצחים, ובמשיח צדקו הנקרא בשמו מביטחי והקויתי,
הוא מעווי ומנוסי ומרתי, אמורתי עהי והוסן ישועתי, וגם מאז
אני הבק בואת האמונה לא נהדרש אצלי כלל ומעמי לא נשתנה,
ואשר אאמינה עתה הוא אשר האמינהו זה עשרים שנה. אתה
אשאל ממך אותה אבקש שמכאן ואילך לא העלה בחתימתך שם
החכם הנכבד אביך ובסודו אל רבוא נפשך ולא התכבד בוכירתו,
ובי לו היתה בחיים חייתו, כותר היה העדר בן כמך על מציאותו,
ועתה גם נפשו תאכל בבית מנוחהו. ישו המשיח יאר פניו אליך
הוא ולא אחר וישם לך שלום ויברכך, פי אוהבך כי רחם דרכך
היה אם שמוע השמע בקול ה' אלהיך אעשה לך שלום ואברכך
בכל מקום אשר אוכיר ארץ שמי לאח וכן יקיר אקדך
אהיך

א'פ'ד

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Texts of the letter

Melo Chofnajim, Abraham Geiger, Berlin, 1840

Kobez Wikkuhim, Abraham Ginzburg, Breslau, 1844

Eben Boħan, P. Heilpern, Frankfort, 1846

The Jewish Encyclopedia, New York, Funk and Wagnalls, 1903

The Catholic Encyclopedia, New York, Robert Appleton Company, 1907

Arnold, T. and Guillaume, A. , The Legacy of Islam, Oxford,
The Clarendon Press, 1931

Baer, Yitzhak, A History of the Jews in Christian Spain, Philadelphia,
Jewish Publication Society, 1961

Baron, Salo Wittmayer, A Social And Religious History of the Jews
second edition, revised, volume IX, Philadelphia, Jewish
Publication Society, 1965

Graetz, Heinrich, History of the Jews, volume IV, Philadelphia,
Jewish Publication Society, 1894